Brigham Young University

BYU ScholarsArchive

2007-02-16

The Impact of Ethnic Identity on Student Achievement in China: A Meta Analysis

Xinyi Wu
Brigham Young University - Provo

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/etd

Part of the Educational Leadership Commons

www.manaraa.com

THE IMPACT OF ETHNIC IDENTITY ON STUDENT

ACHIEVEMENT IN CHINA:

A META ANALYSIS

By

Xinyi Wu

A thesis submitted to the faculty of

Brigham Young University

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Education

Department of Educational Leadership and Foundations

Brigham Young University

December 2006

BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY

GRADUATE COMMITTEE APPROVAL

Of a thesis submitted by

Xinyi Wu

This thesis has been read by each member of the following graduate committee and by majority vote has been found to be satisfactory.

_____   _____

Date   Macleans A. Geo-JaJa, Chair

_____   _____

Date   Clifford Mayes

_____   _____

Date   Donald B. Holsinger

BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY

As chair of the candidate's graduate committee, I have read the thesis of Xinyi Wu in its final form and have found (1) its format, citations, and bibliographical style are consistent and acceptable and fulfill university and department style requirements; (2) its illustrative materials including figures, tables, and charts are in place; and (3) the final manuscript is satisfactory to the graduate committee and is ready for submission to the university library.

_____   _____
Date   Macleans A. Geo-JaJa
                                             Chair, Graduate Committee

Accepted for the Department of
Educational Leadership and Foundations

                                            _____
                                             LeGrand A. Richards

Accepted for the College
David McKay College of Education

                                            _____
                                             K. Richard Young

ABSTRACT

THE IMPACT OF ETHNIC IDENTITY ON STUDENT

ACHIEVEMENT IN CHINA:

A META ANALYSIS

Xinyi Wu

Department of Educational Leadership and Foundations

Master of Education

There have been concerns about low educational achievement of ethnic minority students in China. Previous studies have explored this area, especially in regard to the relationship between economic backwardness and achievement. However, a new field of study examines ethnic identity being considered as a cause of low achievement. This study is to use meta-analysis to determine the aggregate results of current research on the effects of self-identity on ethnic minority students and their achievement in China. The literature has been collected through searching library holdings, and online electronic resource search. Different levels of identity construction are discussed. This thesis concludes that there is a significant relationship between ethnic identity and student

achievement. The findings show that the issue of identity is especially significant to

ethnic groups. However, current focus is still on monetary inputs of education and its

relationship with achievement. Some recommendations are provided for future research.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to express gratitude toward all who have contributed to my thesis. First of all, I would like to thank the Department of Educational Leadership and Foundations for giving me the opportunity to study and do research under the direction of such highly qualified faculty. I would also like to thank the Kennedy Center at Brigham Young University for providing financial support that allowed me to complete research in China.

I am deeply indebted to Dr. Geo-JaJa whose stimulating suggestions and insight were vital to completing my research. He not only helped me understand meta-analysis, but also provided thoughtful guidance for writing my thesis. Likewise, I would like to express my gratitude toward Dr. Mayes, whose encouragement and support provided the confidence I needed to successfully complete my thesis; I am especially appreciative of Dr. Mayes's comments on my literature review. Finally, I want to thank Dr. Holsinger for his insightful comments on ethnic minority education and for sharing the experiences he had in Asian countries.

Many other friends and colleagues have supported in this endeavor. I want to thank them for all their help, support, interest and valuable comments. I want to thank Laura Campbell, my friend and former English teacher, for all her assistance in editing my paper.

I would like to give special thanks to my parents who have provided me with educational opportunities and support throughout all these years. Their love and financial contributions have enabled me to complete this work. I dedicate this thesis to them.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

Prelude

China is a politically unified, but culturally diverse nation. Of the 56 ethnic groups, the Han majority constitutes 92 % of the Chinese population; the 55 other ethnic groups, officially classified by the government as the minorities, represent the remaining 8 % (approximately 105 million people). Born in an ethnic minority family, I am always asking myself if I am lucky or ill-fated. I am lucky because I can somehow benefit from the government policies gearing towards ethnic minorities, such as preferential admission (a type of education policy similar to affirmative action in the United States) and a higher amount of food compensation during the period of planned economy. However, I am often falling into the dilemma of whether or not to identify myself as an ethnic minority. I remembered that I was afraid to tell my classmates in the elementary school that I was an ethnic minority because I did not want them to look at or treat me differently. Sometimes, people would throw out intimidating questions to satisfy their curiosities of certain ethnic cultural practices. Therefore, I tried to blend in by not identifying my ethnic background although my family did practice religious beliefs at home. On the contrary, many ethnic minorities like me are able to identify people from the same group. To date, the concept of ethnicity is still vague to many people, especially the ones from non-ethnic groups. I recall the first time that I dared to tell my friends of my nationality or my ethnic background (minzu); they were all surprised and trying to seek differences. Unfortunately, many ethnic minorities are hardly recognized only by their external appearance or even languages. Through the long process of ethnic interactions and assimilation, large numbers of ethnic minorities have gradually lost their native tongues

and started to use Mandarin Chinese. Except for ethnic groups with distinguished physical and linguistic differences, such as Tibetans, many others, like me, experience the challenge of ethnic identities weakening or even vanishing.

Although the issue of identity made my childhood life more complicated, it did not impede my reception of quality of education. In China, the quality of education is not determined by people, but region. I lived in the Eastern China where education has been recognized as one of the highest among the nation. I was one of the very few ethnic minority students in a school with more than a thousand students. I received the same education as the Han majority students. I felt competitive in all subjects with my classmates, and actually reached high academic achievements in my primary and secondary schools. However, many other underdeveloped regions in China where a great number of ethnic groups reside have poor quality of education, especially the Northwestern and Southwestern regions. I went to Northwestern China for a two-week visit. During my visit, I met a local school teacher with nine ethnic minority students in his class. Having received a high school diploma, he expressed his sadness for not being truly helpful to his students and his willingness to acquire assistance from outside resources. The biggest challenge for this local small school was the lack of textbooks. This teacher told me that he was the only teacher there and no one else showed any interest in teaching in such a remote area.

In addition to the insufficient teaching resources, the hardship of their lives also made education inaccessible. In some regions, school-aged children still have to make a living by renting their horses to tourists for fun rides. Their nomadic lifestyles hinder them from attending regular school on a daily basis. I still recall what a Ph. D. student,

who was an ethnic minority, from one of the top ten universities said to me in our conversation on education for ethnic minorities, "now we talk about quality of higher education and how to make it equitable to everyone in policy, why don't you go to the regions to take closer look at the students? I am from there and I know the only choice for me to change my life is to spend ten times or more effort on studying. That's the only way. The economic backwardness has instigated the fear of continuing poverty among ethnic groups; however, only a few of them overcome the fear through education.

My experiences with ethnic minority students demonstrate how desperate the education for ethnic minorities is. Although the people I met are only a few individuals, they are not alone - they represent large numbers of different ethnic groups. Their equal access to education of any quality is made difficult by geographic location, poverty, low parental expectations, socioeconomic status, and their own desire for education. These and other factors lead to students dropping out of school. Access to education is usually intertwined with issues of school structure, school environment, peer attitudes, quality of teachers and school availability (i.e. distances between schools and households), etc. The inequality in educational opportunities might affect the future of these ethnic minority students as well as that of their families. During this process of gaining education, ethnic minority students struggle, overcome, and achieve in all aspects. Their identity construction constantly shapes their behaviors and attitudes.

Introduction

This study was undertaken to explore current research in the field of education for ethnic minorities in China, specifically focusing on the issue of identity construction and its impacts on school achievement. First, the concept of ethnic minorities will be defined.

Then, education for ethnic minorities in China will be discussed with a detailed background introduction of current challenges that ethnic minorities in China encounter. After this, the statement of the research problem, research question, the need and importance of study, and methodology will be introduced.

Define Ethnic Minority in China

Defining ethnic minorities is not easy in China. Fei xiaotong, a Chinese ecologist, argued that minorities could be differentiated according to a number of criteria: (a) population size; (b) the nature of the identification of the group; (c) the size; (d) location and terrain of the region they occupy; (e) the proportion of members of the minority group that inhabit an autonomous province, prefecture or country, their proximity to and relations with other ethnic groups; (f) whether the ethnic minorities are rural or urban groups, agricultural or pastoral groups, border or inland groups, or concentrated or dispersed groups; (g) whether the group has a strong religious tradition or none; whether the group has a written language or only a spoken one; and finally whether they have had a separate tradition of foreign relations with peoples of another region of the world.

As I mentioned at the beginning, there are 55 ethnic groups officially recognized by the Chinese central government and they constitute approximately 8 % of the Chinese population, though they have different languages, traditions and customs. The coexistence of this diverse ethnic state is the result of long lasting interactions among a variety of ethnic groups with different cultural backgrounds. Some resided at the border of China and constantly had interactions with inlanders from China; however, others immigrated to China through trades and married Chinese over a long period of time. These interactions created a multi-ethnic nation state and contributed to the rise of multi-

ethnic state. However, after the establishment of the People's Republic of China in 1949, China became a sovereign state with goals of unifying the country and strengthening it. These pre-existing ethnic groups within the state border were asked to comply with policies of unification defined in 1949. Non-Han people officially became both Chinese and members of minorities. The Chinese central government believed that these ethnic groups could be potential splitting forces of the state and obstruct the modernization sustained by the government. During the long process of unification, economic and cultural exchanges brought the people of all ethnic groups in China close together, giving shape to a relationship of interdependence, mutual promotion and mutual development among them and contributing to the creation and development of the Chinese civilization. However, at the same time, these ethnic groups still maintain a certain level differentiation by demonstrating different religious beliefs and traditions. This feeling of differentiation sometimes leads to antagonistic attitudes and behaviors towards the goal of unification supported by the government, and it also creates great pressure on the Chinese government to implement policies that could be benevolent toward minorities.

The Chinese central government carried out civilization projects aimed at educating ethnic minorities about universal skills and knowledge and helping ethnic minorities to catch up with the Han majority. This also created identity assimilation between ethnic groups and the Han majority, and hybrid identities began to form. To be able to reach ethnic groups, the state recruited cadres to serve in the central government as role models for the ethnic communities they are originally from. To recruit ethnic cadres, the state sponsored ethnic education from primary school up to college level. The government also took advantage of the culture and language of ethnic districts, thereby

reaching further into the ethnic communities. In addition, some social policies were also implemented to grant privileges to ethnic minorities, such as allowing them a higher birth quota, sponsoring ethnic schools, and giving exemptions to investment restrictions or tax schedules. These policies were intended to provide ethnic minorities with special treatment in which they would be progressively assimilated and trust the government for bettering their lives.

Education, especially civic education, became the channel for ethnic minorities to mobilize in society. Educated ethnic minorities were more productive and capable of obtaining jobs. They could perform competitively in the market and contribute to the welfare of their families.

In this study, the ethnic minorities are defined as people who are officially recognized by the Chinese central government as belonging to 55 ethnic groups residing in Mainland China, representing a small portion (8 %) of the Chinese population, and sharing common language (if there are distinct grammatical and phonological differences from the standard Mandarin Chinese), practicing common cultural customs (dress, marriage rituals, cuisine, religion, and so forth), originating from territories recognized by the government as ethnic autonomous regions, and possessing a strong sense of identity.

Introduction to Ethnic Groups in China

Education for ethnic minorities: policy and challenges. In the past 60 years the Chinese government has been trying to provide equal opportunities to ethnic minority students by implementing policies and regulations that specifically target improving access and developing the quality of education in minority regions. However, the goal of equality has not been achieved successfully at all levels of education. Minority students

have performed poorly in comparison with their counterparts, the Han majority students. Their economic backwardness, lack of political capital, and cultural differences are the primary issues affecting education today. This paper attempts to take the cultural differences as the main factor and look at ethnic identity and its impact on student achievement in China. I believe that ethnic identity is an influential element of students' achievement, especially in the education for ethnic minorities. The previous experiences indicate that the process of constructing identity has led to ethnic minority students' various responses toward education. The process of constructing identities is affected by factors such as family background, community influences, school structure, national education policies, etc. Although the Chinese government policies of ethnic minority education have attempted to eliminate the disparities between the Majority and minority in terms of achievements, the achievement differences can still be observed from different identity constructions.

Education is regarded as a possible solution to solve ethnic conflicts (Morrow & Torres, 1995). By teaching ethnic minority students universal skills and knowledge, the Chinese government believes that a homogenous culture can be gained through these teachings, which would further stabilize the country. The universal skills and knowledge are designed in a national curriculum applicable to all Chinese students and mainly characterized by the values and ideologies from the majority group, and they are not culturally targeted to any ethnic groups. The government feels that if minority students attend different levels of education (primary, secondary, and tertiary), they will be trained and prepared for future regional economic growth and social development opportunities. Educational policies for minorities were established by the government to increase the

chances for ethnic minority students to access education in general; higher education in particular. For example, the establishment of a dual educational system—religion schools and state schools—allows more minority students to have opportunities to learn how to read and write in their preferable educational system. Although an increasing number of ethnic minorities have chosen to send their children to secular schools, in some areas traditional schools, such as Buddhist and Muslim schools, remain the schools of choice for many parents (Wang, 1996). The government also respects the autonomous areas' right to develop ethnic education on its own; which attaches importance to teaching in minority languages and bilingual teaching; strengthens the building of the ranks of minority teachers; offers special care in terms of funds; runs ethnic institutes, schools, and classes that enroll students for future service in specific areas or units; starts counterpart educational support between inland provinces and municipalities and minority areas; and mobilizes the whole nation to support education in Tibet. In 1993, the government proposed that counterpart support and cooperation between the economically and educationally advanced provinces and municipalities and the 143 poverty-stricken ethnic minority counties under government supervision should be started, and defined the cooperative relations and the main tasks of helping the poor through education. The Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Finance jointly organized the implementation of the state's compulsory education project for the poverty-stricken areas. In accordance with the project's plan, between 1995 and 2000, the central authorities would invest 3.9 billion yuan (0.6 billion USD) into this project, which would exceed 10 billion yuan (1.67 billion USD) if the supporting capital to be contributed by local authorities is added to it. The launching of this project played an important role in promoting the popularization of

compulsory education in poverty-stricken ethnic minority areas. The state encourages people to help minority areas to develop basic education through the "Hope Project" and other forms.

In higher education, the preferential admission policy (a form of affirmative action) provides minority students with more opportunities to access higher education. Minorities have generally had fewer educational opportunities than the Han majority because they have traditionally scored lower on the National College Entrance Examination. This disparity ratio is primarily because examinations are based on the Han language, where native Han speakers have a distinct advantage, compared with millions of minorities who learn Han as a second language. Barry Sautman (1999) notes that one of the main purposes for minorities to access higher education in China is to overcome "the problem of the dearth of educationally qualified minority cadres by turning out more bachelors' level graduates" (p. 183). However, inequality is inevitable under this affirmative action-like admittance framework. Access opportunities are not the same for all minority groups, where minority students come to the higher education scene at various levels of preparation. This creates different dichotomous relationships that highlight the rift between rural and urban minority populations, between ethic minorities and Han majority, and among different ethnic groups.

Research problem. The problem appears: the Chinese central government has done a lot of work trying to assist ethnic minorities to improve their quality of education, but it seems they are unsuccessful. A large amount of funds have been allocated in the ethnic minority regions to establish new schools and improve physical conditions of current schools; however, ethnic minority students' achievements in schools are not

significantly improved. The monetary inputs do not lead to definite educational development. Inequality still exists among ethnic minorities and between ethnic minorities and the Han majority.

Research question. The question, therefore, emerges: Does inequality exist only because of economic backwardness and educational accessibility to ethnic minorities? Does ethnic identity impact student achievement? More specifically, a research question rises, especially pertinent to ethnic minority students and parents, educators, and government policy makers: *Do ethnic identities lead to various student school achievements?*

To answer this question, it is important to know what the overall body of research indicates. I am proposing a meta-analysis in my work with all the relevant studies on the given subject of ethnic identity and achievement to determine the aggregate results of current research. These results will include studies from all over the world. There are a variety of ways to educate ethnic minorities in individual countries. Some ways of educating can be transferable between regions and countries, and others are only specifically effective for one country. This study utilizes meta-analysis to examine the effects of ethnic identities, addressing the research question listed above.

The Need and Importance for Meta-analysis

for Ethnic Minority Students in China

There have been some concerns about low educational achievement of ethnic minority students in China. Scholars from China and abroad have discussed the issues of education for minorities. Some scholars focused their studies on certain ethnic minority groups, especially in the aspects of culture and religion (Harrell & Ma, 1999; Mackerras,

1999; Gladney, 1999; Goldstein-Kyaga, 1993). Others explored a holistic approach to discuss theoretical frameworks of minority education, looking at fundamental causes that lead to different levels of student performance (Ogbu, 1998, 1983; Lamontagne, 1999). Additional minority issues that have been discussed in the literature include government policies versus community adaptation (Hawkins, 1978; Lofstedt, 1987; Postiglione 1999) and issues of equality and equity (Kwong and Xiao, 1989). Although religious and cultural factors have been mentioned, none of the studies has looked specifically at the perception of ethnic minorities on education and its subcategories as an independent variable nor examined its relationship with student achievement thoroughly. A meta-analysis is needed to determine the effects of self-identity on ethnic minority students in China, specific components including self-identity, certain ethnic nationalities, and population distribution and density. This study is using China as the target context, and it will likely be different from the studies done in western contexts, such as Gidden's concept of self identity. More details will be provided in the Chapter Three, the methodology of the study.

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

A General Concern of Student Achievement

The discussion of scholastic inputs and outputs has caught the attention of many scholars, most of whom believe that school inputs are key measures of school outputs. The relationship between school inputs and outputs is explained by the concepts of effectiveness and efficiency. The levels of student achievement become the criteria by which money and resources are allocated to schools (Hanushek & Lockheed, 1998). School inputs can be measured monetarily or non-monetarily. An example of a monetary input is financial aid invested in a school to increase budget for class size reduction or a salary raise for teachers. Non-monetary inputs include students' socioeconomic status, family background, and attitudes toward education. Both monetary inputs and non-monetary inputs have an impact on student achievement (Betts, 1996; Hanushek, 1981; Hanushek & Lockheed, 1988; Levin & Kelley, 1994).

Within a given educational system, the distribution of education resources could lead to different levels of achievement. Simply speaking, improper allocation of education resources may negatively influence the efficiency of the system. Insufficient information from which to derive policies could lead to improper allocation of resources. Inaccurately measuring educational inputs could lead to a waste of investment. However, obtaining large amounts of information needed to make decisions regarding educational polices is a high-cost procedure, which requires multiple criteria to collaborate specifically and systematically. Levin & McEwan (2002) conducted an analysis of cost-effectiveness in education. They listed five categories of factors that contribute to student

achievement including human resources, physical spaces, equipment and materials, clients' (family and students) inputs.

Although both monetary and non-monetary factors have been investigated substantially, the debate on whether increasing expenditure of education would significantly improve student achievement, and thus school performance, is still inconclusive. Taylor's (2001) research showed that school expenditures have a positive, statistically significant effect on student achievement. Although the effect is relatively small, it has an effect nonetheless. His argument had been tested in a variety of categories proposed by the policy makers and scholars where monetary inputs were allocated in different areas of school operation.

Reducing class size, increasing teachers' salaries and educations, and updating school facilities were all attempted by policy makers and assessed by scholars on their operational results (Betts, 1996; Borland, Howsen, & Trawick, 2005; Brewer, Kroop, Gill, & Reichardt, 1999; Hanushek, 1981, 1997; Krueger, 1999; Picus, Marion, Calvo, & Glenn, 2005). Mosteller (1995) argued in his Tennessee study that smaller classes produced substantial improvements in early learning. His research also showed that the effect of small class size on the achievement of ethnic minority children was initially double that observed for children of the ethnic majority. In keeping with Mosteller's findings, other scholars stated that class size reduction with increased educational budget inputs did not necessarily impact overall student achievement, but did affect certain group of students. Another study (Borland et al., 2005) pointed out that attempts to empirically identify the relationship between class size and student achievement return results that are mixed at best. Other factors may also have effects on actual achievement.

According to the studies above, it cannot be proven conclusively that monetary inputs have considerable impact on achievement in minority groups, however non-monetary inputs play a contributive role.

Aside from class size reduction, increased salaries for teachers and improved quality of teacher education were also found to be effective ways to boost student achievement (Ballou & Podgursky, 1995; Hanushek, 1997; Lasley, Siedentop, & Yinger, 2006), especially among scholars who strongly support the idea that "money does not matter" and "education cannot do it alone" Levin and Kelley (1994). However, the scholars also argued that relying exclusively on increasing teachers' salaries would not necessarily improve student achievement. Teachers' characteristics, teaching experience, and match or mismatch in student-teacher thinking styles all contribute to students' performance (Lasley et al., 2006; Zhang, 2006). Spencer and Wiley (1981) realized that studying school goals as well as teaching and learning processes were also helpful in measuring student achievement. Hanushek (1997) conducted research on the effects of school resources on student performance. By examining approximately 400 studies, he concluded that there was not a consistent relationship between student performance and school resources. He also proposed an incentive structure of students, teachers, personnel, and schools to consider when evaluating achievement.

School is not the only place to achievement is determined. Any environment that may provide a student with opportunities to socialize or interact with others could be influential to achievement, such as a family network or a community. Some scholars have switched their attention from educational expenditure to the study of family background and parental influences. They looked at parental valuation of education. They also probed

the differences between parents of high achieving students and those of low achieving students (Black, 1999; Chen & Uttal, 1988; Jacob & Harvey, 2005; Mateakeju & Strakova, 2005; McBride & Schoppe-Sullivan, 2005). The concept of social and cultural capital is first articulated by Bourdieu. It holds that cultural capital acts as a social relation within a system of exchange that includes the accumulated cultural knowledge that confers power and status (Bourdieu, 2000). Bourdieu also pointed out that differences in cultural capital would lead to different educational outcomes. His concept of habitus went on to explain that cultural capital is derived from individual habitus, which is established in the family but manifests itself in different ways for each individual. Cultural capital is formed not only by the habitus of the family but also by individual daily interactions and its changes as the individual's position within a field changes.

Furthermore, students' previous schooling and the effort they put into this schooling are taken into account to measure achievement. Carbonaro (2005) found that students in higher tracks put substantially more effort into their studies than students in lower tracks. The differences in educational investment may be due to the students' history of effort and achievement, as well as students' experiences in their classes. Besides parental perception of education, students' motivation to achieve also affects achievement. An example of student-centered learning style versus teacher-centered learning style, (Guest, 2005) was found in a survey of 577 business students at a major Australian university. The survey dealt with their preferences for academic achievement and effort. He found out that flexible learning, especially student-centered learning, has an impact on student achievement though flexible learning does not necessarily lead to

higher student achievement. Teachers, students, schools, and other participants in the education process all have strong influences on students. In addition to the micro-level examination of student achievement found in the examples above, macro-level analysis is implemented concurrently. An example of macro-level analysis is exploring societal and economic environments set by nations and their governments. Levin & Kelley (1994) put forward an idea of cross-sectional studies that would pay more attention to the relationship between education and socioeconomic outcomes.

<div align="center">Student Achievement and Ethnic Minorities</div>

Student achievement has been a concern of educators throughout the world. It has been the subject of national case studies and comparative studies between countries since the beginning of educational theory. Recently, attention to the educational achievement of ethnic minorities has increased. This issue has become not only a national goal to achieve educational equality, but also an international concern, calling all nations to collaborate for a higher quality of education for ethnic minorities.

Not surprisingly, family has a great influence on the achievement of ethnic minority student. Unlike the parents of the ethnic majority students, minority students' parents often have lower expectations for their children's achievement. These expectations are sometimes constrained by family income (Hu & John, 2001; Okagaki & Frensch, 1998). One factor that has been linked to the drop out rate of minority students is that their families often cannot afford high tuition and other school expenses. Therefore, the higher the income of a minority family, the greater the likelihood that the children will attend school and perform at higher levels of achievement. In addition to responsibilities for their families' economic needs, these students sometimes face cultural

challenges when interacting with other students. In the case of many minority parents, their own backgrounds, having been raised as a minority in society, may contribute to their expectations and beliefs in the education of their children. These beliefs are transferred through certain attitudes and values that may either facilitate or hinder their children's achievement in school. The education system must create an appropriate structure for ethnic minorities (Johnson, Crosnoe, & Elder, 2001) in order to correct the current situation.

Outside of the family environment, school is one of the main places where ethnic minority students interact and socialize with other students. In this environment, ethnic minority students develop their attitudes toward schools, teachers, and peer groups (Pritchard, Morrow, & Marshall, 2005). Ethnic minority students will be more likely to engage in academic life if they are treated equally. Schools also need to be aware of the cultural differences in the backgrounds of their students and must be willing to provide curriculum support and education programs tailored to the needs of the ethnic minorities (Saifer, Edwards, Ellis, Ko, & Amy, 2005; Shimahara, Holowinsky, & Tomlinson-Clarke, 2001). It has been proven that minority students can achieve significantly higher in relation to their majority counterparts if they are enroll in a smaller classes (Krueger, 1999) or receive financial aid (Hu & John, 2001). These findings are consistent with Bourdieu's notion of cultural capital as mentioned above (2000).

The gap in achievement between majority and minority students has been explored in many studies such as those mentioned above. There is also a gap between different ethnic groups. The notion of relative deprivation states that certain groups of people feel deprived when they compare their positions to those of others in similar

situations and realize that they have less than they deserve. This condition is measured by comparing one group's situation to the situations of those who are more advantaged (Bayertz, 1999). Ogbu (1978) discovered that immigrant minorities in the United States achieve better education and job opportunities than nonimmigrant minorities because of the differences of their behaviors and attitudes toward the dominant white ethnicity. His approach put monetary issues aside to consider non-monetary inputs, or social aspects, as crucial factors. He established a cultural-ecological theory to explain minority school performance. His theories explored the broad societal and educational factors as well as the dynamics within the minority communities themselves. Ecology is the setting, environment, or world of people (in this case, minorities), and cultures. Here it broadly refers to the way minorities see their world and behave within it.

In his theory, the ethnic minority in China can be seen as *involuntary immigrants*, defined by Ogbu (1978) as

castelike because in every case they were a subordinate group in a stratification system more rigid than social class stratification. In every case, the minorities were historically denied equal educational opportunities in terms of access to educational resources, treatment in school, and rewards in employment and wages for educational accomplishments (p.2).

He argued that students' performance was determined by their desire for status mobility and by their perceived treatment by the majority. He also pointed out that many involuntary minorities have developed an oppositional identity to mainstream society. These individuals are reluctant to cross cultural boundaries and adopt mainstream ways of talking, thinking, and behaving because they fear that doing so will displace their own identity as a minority and alienate them from their peers, family, and community. In this situation, their achievements in education are not only determined by the government's

expansion of education but also by their beliefs, their behaviors, and their perceptions of the educational system.

Lamontagne (1999) proposed another model of student achievement. She put forth an analytical model of educational development that is built in two dimensions: the degree of educational development and its timeframe. The degree of educational development in a social entity is measured in terms of the percentage of the population having achieved a given educational level. The four phases she defined are *low-slow*, *low-fast*, *high-slow*, and *high-fast*. She argued that the disparity between ethnic groups and the disparity between ethnic groups and Han majority, the majority group in China, is affected by the phases they belong to. Low-slow refers to low development level and slow educational achieving level. Low-fast means low development level and fast educational attaining level. High-slow, however, refers to previous high development level but low educational attaining level. High-fast is high development level with fast attaining level. Lamontagne believed that "the counties and cities where the greatest progress was made, in terms of illiteracy reduction, are those where the degree of illiteracy in 1982 was neither very low nor very high" (p. 144). Student achievement in this model is associated with the stages of development.

Identity Construction: An Issue of Minority Student Achievement

As discussed in previous studies, ethnic minorities live in different social environments from the Han majority and interact with people from various backgrounds. To a certain extent, the education system provides an environment for minority students to experience diversity. Minority students might be raised in a family with one specific cultural background but within a large community of different cultural inputs. They go to

school where they meet and interact with teachers, peers, and administrators, and at the same time are influenced by the national education policies implemented by schools. Minority students have to adjust their learning process to reach certain levels of achievement if they enroll in schools with a universal curriculum designed to fit the needs of both majority and minority students, which is common in many cases. Within such a complex society, ethnic minorities constantly construct their identities in order to survive and revive by learning, imitating, interacting, adapting, assimilating, integrating, and even transforming (Hunt, 2003; Marx, 1980; Yinger, 1985). Their ways of learning, and ultimately their performance in schools, is affected by how they identify themselves in different social contexts (Torres, Howard-Hamilton, & Cooper, 2003).

The term identity has been defined mainly by psychologists, sociologists, and anthropologists. These scholars argue that people identify themselves differently according to environments, and that people play a variety of roles throughout their lives both individually and collectively. Stets (2003) explained the meaning of role identity as "the shared view that at the core of an identity is the categorization of the self as an occupant of a role and that within this categorization are the meanings and expectations associated with the role and its performance" (p.105). Thus, the meanings and expectations attached to the role and its performance may come to reflect the behaviors of individuals. If interactions and behaviors with others are stable and sustained over time, small adjustments to the identity may be made in an effort to create as much consistency between identity meanings and perceptions as possible (Kiecolt & LoMascolo, 2003). However, when there is a conflict between perceptions, one dominant perception may override the others and impose pressure on recessive perceptions. This unstable structure

could lead to further compromise or even the vanishing of certain identities. In the opposite process, multiple identities may be formed concurrently. In a given context, they could demonstrate a behavior along with the identity and social interaction, depending on the degree that actors associate themselves with (Cast, 2003; Lawler, 2003). With the support of dominant individuals, students are able to develop feelings of success. The students that were able to constructed successful images of themselves found academic achievement more of a possibility (Oyserman, Gant, & Ager, 1995).

Students' achievement is influenced by their collective identity constructed at home, in communities, in school environments, and even by national driving forces, such as government policies, because of the complexity of identity construction at different levels and in various contexts. The students and their educational providers are both striving to establish a harmonious atmosphere where students can achieve the highest in academic and social lives. In this sense, improving student achievement cannot be solely accomplished by the monetary inputs. The non-monetary inputs, such as family cultures, students' positive feelings of learning, and the community support systems also make important contributions to achievement.

Identity Construction: Overview of Theoretical Models

Having realized the importance of identity and its influences on student achievement, some scholars proposed to have a pedagogy with sensitivity to ethnic identity. They argued that ethnic needs should be met when a new pedagogy is put into practice (Bernstein, 2000; Hoffman, 1998; Oyserman et al., 1995). To improve student achievement, especially in the unprivileged groups, it is crucial to have awareness of

cultural identity and the structural limitations that are often inadvertently imposed upon them by schools and states.

Various models of identity construction have been proposed. Marx (1980) looked into different societies, and argued that social, structural, and cultural alterations could profoundly alter sensibility, consciousness, reflectivity and cosmology. His post-modern identity model emphasized that personal and collective identities are constantly changing through constructing, legitimizing, transmitting, and manifesting in social action. He also proposed a model with four dimensions. This top-down approach includes sub-structural, social structure, cognitive, and expressive cultures. The sub-structural dimension is at a demographic and ecological level. It includes the natural world, the environment and its resources, the size and structure of the population as well as population density and distribution. The social structural dimension is at the institutional level. It focuses on interpersonal behaviors and patterns of larger social organizations and associations. The cognitive and expressive cultures are assigned specifically to individuals. By immersing themselves in the society, individuals learn ideas, beliefs, interpretations, and symbolic meanings. By internalizing these ideas and beliefs, individuals acquire a subjectively experienced psychological reality system. The model that Marx put forth elucidated an external to internal process that an individual experiences in constructing identities.

Unlike Marx, who perceived identity construction from a structural perspective, a social identity development theory holds that identity construction is a developmental process that constitutes four stages (Torres et al., 2003). In the first stage, individuals from oppressed and dominant groups are unaware of the complex codes of appropriate behavior for members of their social group. It then becomes an acceptance stage where

23

people from oppressed groups are thought to be inferior, deviant, and weak. In the next
stage, they begin to acknowledge and question the collective experiences of oppression
and enter into the resistance stage. After this resistance, a new identity is created and
defined. Not only the inferior group but also the dominant group members start to
reframe and create new definitions of their social group identity that is independent of
social oppression. They then begin to project prejudicial views onto oppressed groups.
During this process, ethnic minorities gradually develop attitudes about themselves,
attitudes toward other members of the same minority group, attitudes toward others of
different minority groups, and attitudes toward dominant group members. These attitudes
could potentially form a positive collective mind-set toward education and ultimately
improve achievement from within students. On the other hand, a negative or passive
feeling could also develop and eventually lead to results such as low achievement and
dropouts. Although campus cultures are largely determined by the collective
characteristics of the inhabitants, they usually reflect values of the dominant groups.
When minority students seek to exist in a school culture, they must both adjust to the
dominant culture and learn to behave like their peers, or choose to leave this school
culture behind. According to the needs, ethnic minorities make different choices. If
minority students choose to assimilate, they may successfully improve their educational
achievement but it comes at the expense of weakening minority identities. While
removing themselves from the educational systems might preserve their ethnic identities,
it hardly helps students achieve academic or even social success.

Fischler (2003) came up with a six-step model of race, culture, ethnicity, conflict,
and change in schools. He proposed that the first step involves a crisis and subsequent

feedback from staff members and others involved to create awareness of the situation. The second step, problem identification, focuses on evaluating the incidents or problems that led to the crisis. The incidents or problems are defined and explored by examining all relevant behavior. The third step, confrontation, involves direct confrontation with the principal causes of the crisis. The behavior of concern is openly discussed in terms of causes, effects, and the delivery of appropriate consequences. The fourth step is problem illumination. Individuals are encouraged to become involved and to communicate thoughts and feelings. The fifth step calls for developing and planning an appropriate response to the incidents and problems. The last step is to reflect upon the actual implementation of the process outlined in the model. His model indicates that identity is formed gradually and it adjusts to each other through interactions.

The construction of sub-cultural identity in China with special reference to schooling. Education for ethnic minorities in China is as challenging as it is in other countries. The 55 ethnic minority groups are usually identified as low achievers in school activities. Scholars attempting to understand the causes of poor academic achievement have turned to the perspective of ethnic identity construction. These theories are directly applicable in the certain ethnic regions of China.

The macro and micro factors in ethnic identity construction and educational outcome were tested at the tertiary level by Kayongo-Male & Lee (2004). They developed this theoretical model mainly to examine the relationship between the two types of factors in ethnic identity construction. The model aims to develop an understanding of the connection between academic performance and student empowerment. Ethnic identity is defined as the product of multiple levels of societal

structures in a dialectical relationship within the individual student, who constructs reality and responds to the realities constructed by others. The model includes both macro-level components (such as the nation-state's designation of some groups as minority groups and the social scientific construction of ethnicity) and micro-level components (such as the student's family and community background, significant life events, campus hierarchies, experiences of interaction with other members of the campus, and status negotiation by the student).

By studying ethnic minorities and their construction of ethnic identities in Southwestern China, Lee (2001) categorized the four areas for identity construction. The first area is the society as a whole, where social class is collectively formed and ethnic minorities generally have a clear perception of their racial differences. The second area is in family, which includes significant factors that would affect the individuals' behaviors and perceptions toward other members of the society. Factors within the family include parents' income, parents' attitude, parents' education, gender bias, child labor, and birth control policy. The third area is the village, where cultural deprivation and cultural barriers exist in various interactions. Achieving success in school may also mean severing cultural roots. Successful students, to a certain extent, must leave behind objective ethnic markers, like language and religion, if they want to achieve in school. The school is the site where critical identity construction occurs. Administrators and teachers assign meanings to social actors. Administrators and teachers often label minority children and have the power to make these labels stick. In addition, school provisions to students and the usage of languages may also play a role in identity

construction. These areas of identity construction slowly change students' attitude toward education.

Multiple reasons have been explored by previous scholars' work in addition to theoretical analyses of identity construction and its influences on student achievement. These explorations will be discussed in the following paragraphs.

Geographic location has been considered a fundamental factor that restricts ethnic minority students from equally accessing educational opportunities (Cai, 1994; Chapman, Chen, & Postiglione, 2000; Dilger, 1984; Hannum, 2002; C. Wang & Zhou, 2003). Outside the developed regions of China, ethnic minority students receive insufficient assistance from the government. The Chinese government is discouraged by the high cost of delivering educational resources to outlying ethnic regions when allocating educational resources. Since ethnic regions have had poor educational provisions in the past, the high costs may go to hiring more qualified teachers, building new school facilities, buying more teaching materials and equipments, and even financially compensating minority students. The geographic factors can also be proven essential when ethnic minority students residing in different regions have a significant achievement gap. To a certain extent, geographic location shapes ethnic identities. The variations in achievements among these ethnic minorities are directly related to the quality of education they receive. Ethnic minorities who reside in areas with a high population of the Han majority usually achieve high academic success because they receive education similar to that of the majority. However, in areas with a high population of students of the ethnic minority, where education provision is poorer than that of the majority, students achieve lower. In other words, the more interactions an ethnic minority student has with the Han majority,

the closer the minority student is to the majority culture and the more motivation he possesses to compete with the Han majority. In some cases, students from certain minority groups have levels of achievement that are competitive or even higher than that of the majority. The Hui and Korean ethnic groups are two examples of this. Therefore, the achievement gap is not due only to ethnic background but is also affected by the geographic locations.

As mentioned above, education provisions vary according to geographic locations. In the areas with a large population of ethnic minorities, education is insufficient. Lofstedt (1987) investigated a less developed minority education program relative to the Han majority education. He pointed out that minorities usually lived in the mountains and other remote areas where there was little transportation. These areas were also the least developed, so the expansion of education was slower than that of the developed areas. Cai (1994) identified several characteristics of education for ethnic minorities that, he argued, led to a variety of educational approaches apart from the ones for the Han majority. He recognized that many communities of ethnic minorities are predominantly agricultural and nomadic. Cai stated that these activities would often create a barrier to receiving a formal education. In many rural settings where most minority groups reside, students must travel long distances to attend school. Horse riding is a common means of transportation for many students in nomadic regions. Cai also argued that ethnic minorities are often unwilling to send their children to school because their current lifestyle does not require education. In a rural and nomadic environment, people often have lower motivation to gain an education and transform their ways of life.

The language barrier has caught the attention of another group of scholars (Blum, 2000; Clothey, 2001; Gladney, 1999; Hansen, 1999; Hou, 2000; Lamontagne, 1999; Lee, 2001; Lofstedt, 1987; Postiglione, 1998; Trueba & Zou, 1994; Yuan, 2002; Zhu & Stuart, 1999), and has been the focus of various studies on education for ethnic minorities. Large amounts of scholarly works pointed out that language barriers have affected achievement in terms of knowledge delivery and standard exam procedures. The variation of ethnic languages in China places ethnic minority students in inferior positions in schools where all levels of teachings are carried out in mainly in the Mandarin dialect spoken by the Han majority, the official language approved by the central government.

On one hand, ethnic minority students immersed in a second-language environment are not standing on the same starting line as the Han majority students. It is unsurprising that this situation leads to an achievement gap in schools. On the other hand, exclusively speaking an ethnic language that is not the official language brings significant disadvantages in the Mandarin Chinese dominated society. These students lack job market values if they do not speak Mandarin Chinese. In other words, one cause of ethnic poverty is insufficient Mandarin language training, which has gradually developed into a vicious cycle inside which low achievement in education leads to poor capabilities in market. In this cycle, ethnic groups are hardly capable of competing with the majority. For instance, the Minhe Monguo, a ethnic group from Northwestern China was being taught in Mandarin, a Sinitic language that is very different from their own Altaic one (Zhu & Stuart, 1999). The author of study conducted on the situation called for the Minhe Monguo's ethnic identity to be addressed in the future educational development for their area. Among the scholarly Chinese studies conducted on this issue, the issues of language

have been a focal point as well (Cai, 1994; Teng, 1996; Teng & Su, 1998; X. Wang, 1996a, 1996b; Xie, 1996). These studies not only pointed out the current challenges of delivering education in multiple languages, but also provided tentative solutions, such as adopting bilingual and multilingual education at the primary and secondary levels (Cai, 1994).

Religious factors cannot be ignored in terms of education for ethnic minorities. Although most of Chinese citizens (mainly the Han majority) do not have any religious beliefs, ethnic minorities usually possess some sort of beliefs and traditions such as the Tibetans in the Southwest and Muslims in the Northwest (Goldstein-Kyaga, 1993; Yin, 1998). In some areas, religion is a contributing factor in various lifestyles and ultimately achievement in school (Clothey, 2001; Karmel, 1995-1996; Lee, 2001; Mackerras, 1999; Yin, 1998). Religion is also fundamental to ethnic identity construction. Buddhism, Islam, and Christianity coexist within ethnic groups. Gladney (1999), Goldstein-Kyaga (1993), Johnson (2000), and Kim (2003) touched upon these beliefs respectively and argued that religious factors had impact on the daily lives of ethnic groups in various regions. Kwong and Xiao (1989) discovered that "ethnic groups did not make full use of the available opportunities and certainly had not attained educational equality with the Han" (p. 237). Parents hold their children back to attend state-run schools because they believe that children would not gain the same religious education that they could receive from families. This is especially true when ethnic minorities have strong beliefs in certain religions. A universal curriculum adopted by all state-run schools in China cannot meet the religious needs of all ethnic minorities. In Tibet, Goldstein-Kyaga (1993) addressed the fact that "systems of education are based on the dominant belief system" (p.78). To

transmit a common Han majority culture to Tibetan through the education system may attempt to unify the nation at the cost of erasing the Tibetans' ethnic identity. Tibetan parents agree that social hierarchy can be eliminated by obtaining monastery education which will increase status with political power. An education provided by the central government is not necessarily helpful in improving these Tibetans' social status. In the contrast, high-status monks in Tibet are educated with Buddhist's principles. Similarly, Islamic influences in some areas are strong in personal lives of its adherents and can even guide them toward significantly different private behaviors (Chiang, 2001; Mackerras, 1999). To a certain extent, religion is regarded as an integral part of family life, shaping identities, and unifying members with the same ethnic background.

Economic backwardness is often associated with ethnic minority groups. A common belief held concerning China's ethnic minorities is that they are poor. It is true that many ethnic minorities live below the poverty line but many ethnic minorities live a decent life as well and other are considered very well-off. However, economic backwardness, whether perceived or actual, is detrimental to quality of education. Without sufficient investment in solving this problem, the quality of education for ethnic minorities will not keep pace with the increasing demands (Hou, 2000). Economic reform has focused on the job market, education, and experience marketization. Education serves the best needs of the market. A gap between rural and urban areas is created in terms of economic opportunities and governmental financial investment. The promotion of economic goals for marketized education in China came at the cost of an equitable distribution of opportunities across the urban-rural boundary (Hannum, 1999). Many ethnic minorities residing in rural regions have encountered the challenges of unequal

distribution of resources. During the period of economic reform, the central government did not place education for ethnic minorities intended to train more skilled labors for regional development as a high priority. The overall economic situation in ethnic areas has remained bleak without drastic changes from the government. At the individual level, some ethnic minorities recognize the importance of economic viability and are willing to learn skills that can prepare them for future labor market. They seek as many opportunities as possible to catch the fourth wave of development (Maynard & Mehrtens, 1993) and work hard to be a part of the economic growth in their country. These students usually have weak ethnic identity, and it can be hard to distinguish them from the Han majority. Some ethnic parents are concerned that sending children to school would cost them their labors in maintaining the family's operations. They believe that more laborers are needed to stay in the field or on the farm to produce goods and to meet basic needs (Kwong and Xiao, 1989). These different economic perceptions and their negative impacts on educational choices of ethnic minorities have been studied by various scholars (Dilger, 1984; Gladney, 1999; Hannum, 1999; Hou, 2000; Wu, 2004; Yin, 1998; Yuan, 2002). This situation can further change the identities of ethnic minorities according to economic situation. It especially affects ethnic minorities' awareness of their socioeconomic status and the class stratification in their culture. Juhen Li (2005) conducted a survey in Gansu, Xinjiang, and Ningxia, and found that the low socioeconomic conditions of most ethnic minorities constrain them from providing their children with adequate knowledge and skills. In addition, teachers' salaries are not fully paid in rural settings, especially at the primary and secondary sub-sector levels. Mailan Li (1996) addressed the importance of improving dining and housing services for students'

health. All of these actions require more monetary inputs from the government. She also called for more training for administrators of these schools and clear assignments of teachers' responsibilities. Furthermore, Teng and Su (1998) pointed out that lack of funds and insufficient facilities prohibit administrators and teachers from maintaining schools at lower levels than schools that are well funded.

At an individual level, Zhong and Kong (1997) addressed the psychological characteristics of education "receivers." Their studies were conducted in institutes of higher learning on the select few minority students that scored well on the rigid National College Entrance Exam. They noticed that these students lacked a clear purpose for gaining education, although they often expressed confidence in terms of having reached a social status in their local minority spheres. However, only a small portion of ethnic minority students had the opportunity to participate in higher education. This situation creates an educational inequality gap among minority group members. This gap is further exacerbated by the fact that very few minority students have the opportunity to pursue a higher education degree. These students do not have the opportunity to attend higher education and are discouraged in the secondary schools, and tend to perform poorly academically and often exhibit disciplinary problems. Even minority students with the highest achievement are still incomparable with their Han counterparts in university courses. Some minority students demonstrate limited career goals by focusing only on passing their current courses. They lack long-term goals and do no truly work toward a degree or an academic career. These students view universities as little more than places to get diplomas for job seeking after graduation. In this environment of career-driven education, minority students gradually construct their identities as they attempt to fit into

this environment. In addition to educational prospects, the vast opportunities available to urban residents tempt rural-based minority students to stay in big cities instead of returning to their hinterland homes. Juhen Li (2005) substantiates this "brain drain phenomenon" that lures minority students away from their rural homes as they look for the educational and career opportunities that do not exist in their rural homelands.

Xie (1996) observed the feelings of low self-esteem and inferiority within minority students and predicted that these feelings would lead to lower achievement. One side of Xie's argument concerned minority students who look upon the development of their country favorably. On the other hand, these students also sense the perpetual discrimination from the Han majority students, especially in terms of scholastic performance and job competition. When these two feelings collide, one feeling tends to override the other. They feel open, friendly, and trusting in the company of those who respect their indigenous cultures. Yet they also establish their own groups of friends, especially when their common interests are threatened.

Identity construction can also cause various learning patterns to develop. Ethnic minorities often develop their learning patterns and attitudes toward schooling by socializing with other students (Din, 1998; Lu & Kong, 2001; Q. Wang & Li, 2003). Lu and Kong (2001) argued that while non-intelligence factors are not directly involved in discernible learning activities, these factors still shape an individual's consciousness and influence an individual's attitude toward learning.

Ethnic identity construction: A global concern. From a broader perspective, education for ethnic minorities is a worldwide issue, especially when related to multiculturalism, gender and race, bilingual education, and deculturalization. In Israel,

Watzman (2004) examined the Atidim program run by the Israeli army in conjunction with two of the country's universities. The program educates young people from disadvantaged ethnic and social groups in skilled professional fields. The education of the participants provided a good example for other ethnic individuals seeking to increase college enrollments and graduation rates among disadvantaged minorities. In Finland, Sjoholm (2004) discussed recent developments around the position of English as a foreign language (EFL) in the Finnish bilingual context. He found that as a result of the dominant status of English in the mass media that the Swedish minority experienced heavily, attitudes toward the language are extremely positive among these students and they are strongly motivated to acquire the language. Students at the lower-secondary level of English proficiency consistently prefer a spoken "conversational" variety of English that they probably pick up independently outside of school and seem to be more familiar with U.S. vocabulary than British. Students at the upper-secondary level of proficiency, however, appeared to be much more influenced by formal English taught in the classroom, possibly because such students encounter less English in their leisure activities. In the United States, Saenz (2004) revisited the issue of resources and information for ethnic minorities. He pointed out that community colleges are vital gateways to higher education for racially and ethnically diverse students. As minority students arrive in increasing numbers at their doorsteps, community colleges must strive to better serve their emerging majority populations so as not to dampen these students' long-term prospects for educational achievement and success.

In Australia, Hannan (1987) pointed out that multiculturalism was seen as an educational disadvantage, with special provisions made for limited- or non-English-

speaking students. This educational debate, however, soon became a cultural debate, and has led to the establishment of the field of Australian Studies. The need to ensure equality in education requires some guarantee of equal access to a fairly high level of general education. While ethnic minorities might ask for programs teaching their native languages or cultures, they will not favor any form of multiculturalism (for example, varying the curriculum) which appears to threaten access to education or success in achievement. The content of an average curriculum in most parts of Australia is relatively culturally blind. However, content is the most superficial level of curriculum. The most useful form of commonality, and one consistent with a degree of cultural pluralism, may be a commonality of principles and values. In a curriculum consciously based on values, acceptance of democratic pluralism would be reflected in a pedagogy of open inquiry and thoughtful toleration of differences. The non-language aspects of a multicultural curriculum should include components reflecting the composition of the student groups, but must teach with a perspective that makes these components accessible and relevant to all students. Successful multicultural curriculum development depends on (1) resolving apparent conflicts between schools and central authorities, (2) incorporating the views and values of parents and community, and (3) acquiring staff members whose backgrounds and attitudes reflect the plurality of the community. Foster (1985) examined the issues and controversies related to immigration in Australia, the acceptance of the "multicultural Australia" concept, and the structure of the educational system. The study argues that while there has been a manifest transition from migrant to multicultural education, forces favoring the status quo have created a latent, de facto ethnic educational philosophy.

Berry (1981) addressed the idea that differences in cognitive styles or intellectual behavior can be attributed to different ecological and cultural influences. These influences (such as the type of subsistence economy, social stratification, socialization, and role specialization) affect the development of a particular cognitive style. The effects of these influences are determined by the extent to which an individual relies on the external environment. Individuals who tend to accept the external environment are considered relatively more field dependent, while those who act on it are considered relatively more field independent. The situation that develops under these traditional ecological-cultural conditions is also affected by acculturative influences, such as education, a shift from traditional economy to wage employment, and urbanization. Among immigrants, acculturative factors may encourage a tendency toward field independence and thus reduce large cultural variations in populations. In some cases, however, the traditional cognitive-adaptive style may persist and lead to numerous cultural differences in societies   that are host to immigrants. In these societies, the implications of different cognitive styles for the educational process should be considered in planning educational services. To treat all students as culturally and psychologically identical is to interpret stylistic differences as deficits rather than qualitative, socially enriching variations.

The studies from various parts of the world address similar issues to those facing education for ethnic minorities in China. This area of study has caught attention and raised calls for more research on the subject. Although the factors mentioned above have been explored in detail, the relationship between ethnic identity and achievement has barely been touched by research thus far. At this point, there is a great need for

interpretation of the research that has been done to make informed decisions regarding future research orientations. Serving as a critique of what has already been done, this study aims to help improve the quality of research in this field. It will also contribute to expanding the knowledge of education for ethnic minorities in various cultures.

CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY

To obtain the studies used in the meta-analysis, a search was performed using every major social science research database to find studies examining the relationship between self-identity and ethnic minority students' achievement in China. Both Chinese and English literatures are included on the topic of ethnic identity and student achievement. The studies done in China and other countries on this particular topic are considered to be applicable.

A library catalogue research at Brigham Young University was performed, and relevant books were obtained through the interlibrary loan program. The search terms include education for ethnic minorities, ethnic minorities in China, multicultural education, cultural identity, minority student achievement, Chinese government policy on ethnic minorities, ethnic minority previous schooling, and several other terms. Chinese literature reviews were completed in China through library holdings and The Chinese Journal Network (*Zhong Wen Qi Kan Wang*). The key search terms included ethnic minorities (*shao shu min zu*), education for ethnic minorities (*shao shu min zu jiao yu*), ethnic minority and sociology (*shao shu min zu and she hui xue*), and ethnology (*min zu xue*). Other Chinese literatures were reviewed through the Chinese Thesis and Dissertation Archive in the National Library of China. Studies were also retrieved from the Library of Institute of Education in Tsinghua University and library of Nanjing University. The last portion of literatures was obtained from my courses' materials on education and development.

Library Holdings

The Harold B. Lee Library at Brigham Young University holds more than six million items in its various collections. It has an extensive English collection of social science and education. Its periodical collection also covers key educational journals published in the United States and other countries. The interlibary loan service is made available to all students on campus.

The National Library of China is the biggest library in China and has a large collection of more than 20 million items, most of which are in Chinese. It collects each doctoral dissertation and master thesis published in China. All university libraries submit their students' dissertations annually to the National Library of China for archival purposes. It also has a large collection of books on ethnic minorities and books written in the languages of China's ethnic minorities.

The library at the Institute of Education, School of Humanities and Social Science at Tsinghua University is a good resource for scholarly articles in the Chinese language. The library of the Institute of Education has a collection of 6,000 books and periodicals, containing the key education journals in China from various universities and research institutes. It provides faculty members and students from the Institute of Education with information on current educational policies and issues. Nanjing University is one of the top five universities in China. Its library has a holding of more than four million items, and is one of the top university libraries in China. It also holds a large number of resources on Eastern Asian Studies.

Online Electronic Resource Search

ERIC (EBSCO) is the U.S. Department of Education Resource Information Center databases. It contains indexing and abstracts from thousands of research and technical reports in the Resources in Education Index (RIE) from more than 750 education and education-related journals in the Current Index to Journals in Education (CIJE). It is updated quarterly.

The Education Full Text (Wilson Web) contains indexes and abstracts from a core group of 430 international periodicals, yearbooks, and selected books in education. Abstracting coverage begins with January 1994. Full-text coverage begins with January 1996.

The Digital Dissertations (ProQuest) database represents the work of authors from over 1,000 graduate schools and universities. It includes abstracts for dissertations beginning in 1980 and for master's theses beginning in 1988. Full text for dissertations published after 1997 is also available. It is updated monthly.

The ERIC Homepage has connections to many components of the ERIC system including the ERIC database, ERIC Clearinghouses, Support Components, and other services.

The Ingenta database includes indexes, articles and table of contents pages from both general and scholarly journals in all disciplines. The articles and abstracts can be searched by author and keywords. It is updated daily.

JSTOR compiles archives of important scholarly journals and provides access to these journals as widely as possible. Although it is not a current issues database and there is typically a gap of one to five years between the most recently published journal issue

and the back issues available in JSTOR, it spans many disciplines, including social science and education.

The International Education Network (AEI) is the Australian Government International Education Network, a web-based database on international education, export education, transnational education, and international students. The Database of Research on International Education contains details of over 3,300 books, articles, conference papers, and reports on various aspects of international education from publishers in Australia and overseas.

The British Education Index Recent References provides information and resources for educators, focusing on recent public policy affecting educators, as well as information on the content of several educational journals. Coverage is from 1976 to the present.

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)has publications, reports, and statistics with focus on international education issues.

Social Sciences Abstracts (EBSCO) is produced by the H.W. Wilson Company. It contains indexing for more than 500 publications covering a wide range of interdisciplinary fields such as addiction studies, anthropology, corrections, economics, gender studies, gerontology, minority studies, political sciences, psychology, and sociology. Indexing coverage dates back to 1983 and abstracts date back to 1994.

The Chinese Journal Network (*Zhong Wen Qi Kan Wang*) contains over 7,300 Chinese full text journals and includes 16 million articles and increases by 1.5 million each year. It also contains over 260,000 digital dissertations from more than 305 universities and research institutes.

The combination of these databases provides a comprehensive source for literature on ethnic identity and student achievement in both English and Chinese. Since many online resources are interrelated, some articles appeared several times in different databases. The English keywords used in the library catalog searching were searched in abstracts. Because some of the databases were updated periodically and there were updates during the course of research, the searching was conducted periodically.

Some course readings used in education and development classes were also included in research for this thesis, particularly on the topic of non-monetary inputs and achievement. Although none of the articles are specifically associated with ethnic minority education in China, some articles provide theories in the field of education and development and criteria that are considered to be fundamental in constructing and developing identities.

Data Classification and Comparison

After collecting the literature from all possible sources, each article was carefully read and the major ideas were identified according to research questions. The major ideas were reviewed and grouped according to the ways in which the authors approached the research problems. The articles in Chinese were translated and separated from the English articles for the purpose of differentiating ideas proposed by Chinese scholars residing in China and overseas scholars who have special interest in Chinese education.

In order to show the availability of current research on ethnic identity and achievement and the development of this interdisciplinary issue, a top down approach was launched. The studies were classified as world studies, national studies, and regional studies on education for ethnic minorities. The world studies included studies on ethnic

identity and achievement outside of China, such as studies done in the United States and Europe. The national studies contained research on Chinese ethnic minorities and their achievement with specific focus on identity issue. The regional studies comprised field work done in an identified ethnic minority region with content in process of ethnic identity construction. The studies were then re-categorized into theoretical works, empirical studies, and policy papers. The Chinese literature will be separated from the English literature for the purpose of analyzing the differences in methodologies and fields of focus. Each article will be given a special identifying code:

W: World Studies

R: Regional Studies

N: National Studies

T: Theoretical works

E: Empirical Studies

P: Policy Paper

1. English

2. Chinese

For example, if an article is written in English, arguing a variable that would lead to a variety of student achievement in the multicultural education of the United States, it will be coded as WT1. After coding all the articles, they were sorted according to codes. Variables will be identified from each study and will be labeled as A, B, C, D, etc.

Analytical Approach

This meta-analysis examined the relationship between Chinese ethnic minority students' identity and their school achievement. The first analysis included various

subcategories of identity construction of ethnic minority students, such as individual level and school environment. The second analysis examined the association between specific sites of identity construction (e.g. awareness of inferiority in schools, cultural differences, religious practices, needs of receiving education, and family responsibility) and student achievement. The third analysis investigated the relationship between ethnic identity and student achievement by probing the identities that lead to certain ethnic groups' students performing better than others. The last analysis used a demographic perspective to scrutinize the ethnic population distribution and density, and looked at identity variation within the same ethnic groups.

Each study included in this meta-analysis met the following criteria:

1. The studies could only be ethnic minority studies in China, excluding studies based solely on bilingual education for ethnic minorities.

2. The studies could be theoretical works, empirical studies, and policy papers.

3. The studies could be in English or Chinese, depending on the availability and accessibility to the resources.

4. Chinese identity studies conducted in the countries other than China, such as Chinese immigrant studies, were excluded.

5. Ethnic identity studies exclusively related other social issues, such as social economic status, political autonomy, and acculturation without considering education as a part of identity construction process, were excluded.

6. Historical reviews of ethnic identity change and its impacts on student achievement were excluded.

Criteria

According to the research question, the ethnic identity can be subcategorized as the general impact of ethnic identity and the specific impacts of ethnic identity on student achievement. The general impact of ethnic identity involved scholarly work included the overall measure of constructing ethnic identity and its influences on student achievement, as defined by the researchers of a particular study. If a study did not have an overall measure of ethnic identity, the effect size of this variable was determined by combining all its discrete measures. The specific impact of ethnic identity included a specific measure of how ethnic identity is constructed, as distinguished from other measures of ethnic identity construction used in the current study.

The process of constructing ethnic identity is complicated. It can be performed in the following circumstances. These criteria are contributing more or less to ethnic identity construction.

Socioeconomic status: The extent to which ethnic minority students perceive their social and economic status in comparison with the Han majority students. They include parents' occupation and income, family household, and residential location.

Practice of religion: The extent to which ethnic minority students identify themselves clearly with certain religious beliefs and practices at home and in social contexts.

Language usage: The extent to which ethnic minority students use the dominant language and their specific ethnic language at home and in schools and differentiate ethnicity from each other, including education delivery language.

Parental choice of education: The extent to which ethnic minority families choose either religious or secular education, formal or informal education for their children.

Peer interaction in schools: The degree to which ethnic minority students interact with other Han majority students and observe the different treatment in schools.

Teacher-student relations: The extent to which either ethnic minority students establish relations either with Han teachers or ethnic minority teachers.

Lifestyle: The effects of lifestyle, depending upon whether ethnic minority students live in a rural or an urban area, including agriculture, industry, nomad, or other type of lifestyles.

Local needs of education: The degree to which ethnic regions or communities perceive the importance of education in the present and functions of education in the future spurring social development and economic growth.

National policy (preferential admission): The extent to which ethnic minority students are treated either superiorly or inferiorly in comparison with the Han majority students, such as preferential admission policies.

<div align="center">Summary</div>

The literature was collected by searching library holdings and online electronic resources. Interlibrary loan service was also used to expand the access to library collections, thus a comprehensive search for literature on ethnic minority education in China was achieved. The methodology to review and analyze the literature obtained was also specified in this chapter. A full range of criteria that contribute to ethnic identity construction was listed. Four groups of questions were also identified to examine the process of ethnic identity construction and how it impacts students' achievements. No matter what the contributors are, whether stated or unstated as factors of leading to

certain ethnic identity, the author argues that these criteria all collectively affect students'

achievements.

CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS

This chapter answers the research question "Do ethnic identities lead to various student school achievements?" by presenting the results obtained from applying the criteria that have been discussed in the previous chapter. The results will be explained by indicating the identified factors that contribute to identity construction in China, such as education environment, quality of teachers and methods of teaching, education expenditure, and parents' social position. These identified factors in China will be also compared with factors identified in other countries. In addition, the results will be discussed in five categories: theoretical exploration of ethnic identity, impacts of national-level identity construction, impacts of school environment, impacts of family and home, and impacts of interethnic perceptions. The supportive evidences are provided in Table 1 and Table 2 listed in Appendix A and Appendix B.

Overall, the results of this meta-analysis indicate that non-monetary factors have played important roles in affecting academic achievement. Ethnic identities do have an impact on students' school achievement, but there is no significant direct correlation between one or more individual factors with achievement. The results also indicate that the majority of work has not explicitly addressed the issue of ethnic identity and its influence on student achievement. A large number of articles written on ethnic identity in China by Chinese scholars have focused on policy suggestions as they advocated stability-oriented national policy implementation to meet the best needs of the country and ethnic minorities. In addition, the study has confirmed the importance of ethnic components in the education system in China. Substantial discussions of the results will be presented in the following five categories.

Theoretical Exploration of Ethnic Identity and

its Association with School Achievement

Some theoretical work published by scholars around the world has proven that
ethnic identities do, in fact, impact achievement. Three studies called for critical
pedagogy of formulating curriculums for ethnic students and raised macro- and micro-
level analysis of identity construction and status negotiation. They outlined six steps from
growth to crisis (Fischler, 2003; Kayongo-Male & Lee, 2004; Trueba, 1994). Lee (2001)
argued that ethnic identity is treated as fluid, situational, and changeable. It is understood
that identity is socially constructed; therefore, individuals arrived at their identity via a
process of interaction. Lee used examples, such as using the national curriculum,
abandoning a familiar way of life to go to school, and lacking solid Mandarin Chinese
language skills; to prove that ethnic identity is crucial to educational achievement.
Kayongo-Male & Lee (2004) pointed out that ethnic identity is conceptualized as the
product of multiple levels of societal structures in a dialectical relationship with the
individual student, who constructs his own reality and responds to the constructions of
others.

Impacts of National-level Identity

Construction on School Achievement

The contributive factors in establishing identity have been reviewed at the
national level, the school level, the family environment, and the individual consciousness
toward environment. At the national level, governmental education policies for ethnic
minorities, government expenditure, and the government's purpose of education were all
discussed. The various facets of identity establishment are an issue that has long been

reviewed from various angles. There were a total of 33 articles addressing this issue with 15 focusing on policy, 11 on expenditure, and six on the purpose of education.

An article about policy argued that the power of the government and its policies are shaped by political power (Goldstein & Kyaga, 1993). Two more recent articles recognized the political context of economy (Hannum, 1999) and opposed the trend of marketization of education. They argued that in a new, marketized environment, education for ethnic minorities could suffer from inequality for the sake of meeting the market needs of human capital. Two articles addressed the government's ethnocentric attitudes toward ethnic minority regions when it implemented new policies for these ethnic groups (Karmel, 1995). There was a gap between policy making and policy implementation, as the policies were not made for the benefits of ethnic minority students. Both articles specifically addressed preferential policy for ethnic minorities, pointing out the advantages and disadvantages of the policy in addressing the need for more equality among students from different ethnic groups.

As far as education expenditure is concerned, economic backwardness, poverty, and insufficient provisions for education were the main issues addressed (Gladney, 1999; Kwong, 1989; Lofstedt, 1987). Economic backwardness, and the ensuing poverty, stem from being ignored by the government during periods of economic development. Poverty creates antagonistic feelings toward the government and continues to distinguish ethnic minorities from the Han majority. Social and economic backwardness is a frequent stereotype associated with ethnic minority students and is blamed for their perceived laziness and poor education achievement.

Although the government has implemented policies especially for ethnic minorities, the intent of these policies is usually to create a unified, stable state and homogenous culture. These intentions actually undermine students' ethnic identity. The policies mold ethnic minority students to comply with national policies and serve the nation while curtailing the connection of ethnic minorities with ethnically similar groups from bordering countries. This becomes the mechanism to discourage external loyalties. Therefore, in order to preserve their ethnic identity, some ethnic minorities turn hostile toward the government and its policies. Their perception of state-run education would also be a tool of the government to acculturate non-Han groups. Modernization is a perpetual factor in eliminating ethnic identity. One article (Teng, 1996) indicates that increased globalization will bring new challenges in education for ethnic minorities. Ethnic minorities confront not only the possibility of losing identity in China, but also becoming unidentified globally.

<center>Impacts of School Environment</center>

<center>on Ethnic Achievement</center>

One of the challenges facing the school system is delivering education in a certain language. Although any studies of bilingual education for ethnic minorities are exempt in this study and no language policy was discussed in detail, many scholars have touched upon this issue. Five articles recognized language differences and their sizable impact on achievement for students whose native language is not Mandarin Chinese.

Ethnic minority students may perform better if classes are taught in their native languages and the curriculum is tailored to their needs. Some ethnic students resist attending state-run schools because they lack confidence in their language skills. They

are often despised by their Han counterparts, who perform much better in tests and other forms of academic competition. These minority students perceive school as an inimical place where they are treated as inferior participants in the education system. These negative feelings associated with school could be a main factor in lower academic achievement for these students.

Teachers, administrators, and peers are the main components of a school environment and are directly related to each student's performance. Five articles explore the impacts of these stake holders while they interact with ethnic minority students. Teachers and administrators assign meanings to each student and have their perceptions of students. Ethnic minorities also develop a sense of identity in school while they interact with each other.

Impacts of Family and Home Environment
on Ethnic Achievement

Ten articles have shown family background and home environment as important factors in school performance. Seven articles illustrate the significant contribution of family religion to school performance. They believe that the home environment is where ethnic minority students start to interact and negotiate their environment and essentially build their ethnic identities. The articles examine social status, social competition, social stratification, and family members' interaction as variables in the successful or unsuccessful development of ethnic identity and the effects that follow.

Parental social position was also discussed in various studies. Two articles show that family units and differences in social stratifications influence educational achievement in ways of parental encouragement and coaching. For example, children

from more educated families do better than those from less educated families. The setup of the examination system also gives children with intellectual family backgrounds more opportunities to receive education, and this gap is said to be widening. In this sense, ethnic students born in peasant and worker families often perceive themselves as inherently inferior to students from intellectual family background (Kwong, 1983) and this belief is reinforced by the education system. The social stratification is also related to socioeconomic status (Hannum 1998). Clearly, ethnic students usually have a lower socioeconomic status when compared to their Han counterparts. On one hand, this lower status might motivate some students to work hard to climb the economic ladder and gain a more favorable position. On the other hand, some students are discouraged by their lower achievement in all aspects of their lives.

Parents' expectations for their children's education and their educational philosophy are essential in the home environment. Xie (1996) pointed out that the higher the parents' expectations of their children's choice of middle school, the better the child's academic achievement. This indicates the complexity of the choice of going to school is sometimes made by parents of these ethnic minorities.

Religion is another factor at various levels of achievement. Three articles on Tibetan education and three articles on Islamic education mention the significance of religion and explore the concept of a dual education system. Religion has a very strong impact on ethnic identity, especially for students who have a distinguished religious belief. The curriculum that is designed by the central government without consideration of religious elements would not attract the students with religious beliefs. In order to preserve their ethnic identity, these students take a different route and enroll in religious

education, which is an informal education and is not included in the education system provided by the national government.

Impacts of Interethnic Perceptions

Cultural inequality also impacts students' achievements. This inequality does not come from the various economic levels, but from cultural differences. Presuming cultural superiority, eight articles considered this issue. Some ethnic minority students perceive their culture as inferior to that of the majority, which leads to different attitudes toward their classmates. Many times the mentality that they are not going to do well in class because they are minorities impacts their achievement much like a self-fulfilling prophecy. Often they have no desire to accomplish more than what is necessary to get a passing grade. Eight articles touch upon this concept. Ethnic minority students often take the perceptions of others and shape their own perceptions of self and education around them.

Conclusion

According to these findings, no positive or negative relationship was concluded between ethnic identity and student achievement. All variables were only reviewed as factors that impact student achievement or cause low achievement in some circumstances.

CHAPTER FIVE: SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Summary

In order to answer the research question – "Do ethnic identities affect students'

school achievements?" - a meta-analysis is used to show the relationship between ethnic

identities and school achievement. By reviewing previous scholars' work, this

relationship has been well-explored and shown to be significant. The majority of the

previous research has been focused on the economic backwardness of ethnic minorities

and their lack of education in general. Various other factors have been discussed as well.

Socioeconomic Status

Almost all of the work done by scholars has mentioned socioeconomic status as

the crucial factor that leads to low achievement of ethnic minority students. The central

government has to admit that the low socioeconomic status of ethnic minorities had

caused ethnic minorities' unequal access to schools. Although preferential admission has

been given to the ethnic minorities who have the opportunity to take the National College

Entrance Exam and to attend higher institutes of learning, their low economic status still

remain a core constrain in having access to higher education. Many school-age students

must work to help subsidize their families' income, which gets in the way of their

education. While much work has been done in terms of the socioeconomic status of

ethnic minorities, this factor has not been elaborately studied in conjunction with the

process of ethnic identity construction. According to Lee (2001), parents' income has an

impact on students' identity when they interact with other students in school. The

perceptions that ethnic minority students develop through acknowledging their

socioeconomic status can shape their long term attitude towards their studies and

influence their achievements. Residential location has also affected identity construction. However, most research only considers the economic backwardness and insufficient educational provision that could be caused by residing in the less developed areas of China. These studies seldom relate low achievement with regional identity and feeling of inferiority that ethnic minorities may experience when living in remote areas. More empirical studies are needed to explore the relationship between socioeconomic factors and identity construction in ethnic minority students.

Practice of Religion

Although religion has no effects on education for the Han majority students, it has significant impact on ethnic minority students, especially among Islamic and Buddhist ethnic groups. The Han majority population perceives some ethnic groups as having unique cultural traditions and customs and treats them differently in school though these ethnic groups have no declared religious beliefs. Some work done in Xinjing and Tibetan autonomous regions discussed the importance of religion in education and its indispensable relationship with secular education provided by the state. When ethnic minority students have options to attend either religious or secular schools, many parents believe that religious schools can preserve their cultural identities as opposed to the secular education where ethnic minority students often sacrifice their identities to assimilate themselves into the mainstream Han culture. Students are often motivated to assimilate into Han culture to have access to more economic opportunities or receive higher education and find jobs in the future. Religion is a main element in constructing identities, and can create collective antagonistic feelings among ethnic groups. No localized curriculum is thus far a factor that leads to unwillingness to perform well in

state-run schools as a form of rebellion which leads to poor achievements. Scholarly work has found that these ethnic minority students identify themselves strongly with certain religious beliefs and practices that take place at home and other social contexts. It is important to note that the practice of religion is only associated with certain ethnic groups and their educational achievements. The complete separation of religion and cultural practices is by no means possible, as religious or cultural beliefs are essential in identity construction and attitudes toward educations. More research is needed to determine the religious or cultural practices which might stimulate or hinder educational achievements of ethnic minority students. Such future research that explores the association of cultural or religious practices with education will bring a better understanding of the factors that face minority students in the realm of education.

Language Usage

The discussions of language usage occupy a large portion of studies of education for ethnic minorities, especially on student achievement. The literature pointed out that many ethnic minority students who perform poorly in school have a low language proficiency in Mandarin Chinese, the official language and course delivery language in most schools. Having attended the same schools as the Han majority, these students did not score high in exams because these exams are written in their non-native Mandarin. Although in some schools, bilingual education has been implemented, it has not fully taken effect. Ethnic minority students still have difficulty mastering Mandarin while simultaneously attempting to learn all of their coursework in this language. In the past, language usage has not been considered closely tied with ethnic identity construction. Instead of seeing language as a medium of creating identity, scholars have focused on

language as a barrier in education delivery in schools and ultimately a main cause of low achievement. Previous works have recommended changes to language policies, such as publishing bilingual textbooks in ethnic minority regions, hiring bilingual teachers, and giving exams to students in their native languages. It is also clear that ethnic minority students primarily use their native languages at home to communicate with their parents and tend to use language to differentiate among students in interactions at school. More work needs to be done comparing language usage in school and at home, and investigating similarities and differences in this language usage. By noticing the discrepancies, certain processes of identity construction may come through language as students gradually develop the attitudes toward their teachers and peers by using the languages in different contexts. Therefore, language usage is not only an issue of communication, but also associating with identity construction. Both lead to low achievement.

Parental Choice of Education

Parents' attitudes toward education provided by the state and local community affect identity construction from a very young age. Parental choice of education is influenced by economic background, religious beliefs, understanding of the importance of education, and their perception of family and community needs. This factor cannot be clearly separated from other factors mentioned above. The various factors that influence identity construction are interrelated and overlap one another. Family is the basic unit where ethnic minority students start to internalize cultural traditions and customs and develop an identity that is tied to their culture. Parents' choices and attitudes toward education have a direct impact on children's behavior in school. As previously mentioned,

parents' views of education are subject to their perception of its usefulness. If a child's school attendance comes at the expense of loss of family income, many parents would choose to keep their children out of school. In addition, the options between religious and secular education, and between formal and informal education, are dependent upon the strength of families' religious beliefs and the extent to which families have assimilated into the mainstream Han culture. When ethnic minority children begin to learn Mandarin, the universal knowledge taught in state-run schools, they tend to weaken the ethnic identity that traditional families possess. At the micro level (family and local community) identity construction takes place as well (Kayongo-Male & Lee, 2004). The majority of research has shown that family is an important factor that influences students' achievement in schools. This scholarly research indicates a sufficient amount of attention paid to ethnic family background, particularly their socioeconomic status. However, an in-depth exploration of identity construction in the family and parental choice of education has not been significantly examined in China. It is interesting to observe how identity is initially created, gradually developed, steadily formed, and can even vanish. The historical, social, political, and cultural inputs make considerable contributions to identity construction in families and by extension, students' achievement in school. More empirical studies need to be undertaken to examine the similarities and differences among ethnic families, and to understand the variables that cause differences in achievement.

Peer Interaction in Schools

Chen, Rubin, and Li (1997) argued that children's individual social functioning and adjustment contributed to their academic achievement in areas such as social competence,

aggression-disruption, leadership, and peer acceptance. When ethnic minority students interact with other students, whether they are the Han majority ethnicity or of the same ethnic background, they constantly develop attitudes and behaviors related to one another. These identities that they construct in school from peer interactions lead to positive or negative learning attitudes or patterns, and may lead to a variety of levels of achievement. Both peers and teachers can help these ethnic minorities build achievement-oriented selves (Lee, 2003). However, few studies specifically discussed the impact of school environment on learning in terms of identity construction. Some work did demonstrate that some ethnic minority students resisted attending state-run schools. Research focusing on peer interactions and achievement usually examines ethnic minorities as a whole population in opposition to the Han majority. More empirical research is needed to determine the specific ways, such as verbal and nonverbal communication, that peers interact to affect behaviors, attitudes, and identity.

Teacher-Student Relations

Teacher-student relations are very crucial in boosting or hampering student achievement. Researchers discovered that there were not enough qualified teachers in schools where large numbers of ethnic minority students were present. The teachers were either non-bilingual or lacked necessary knowledge to adequately teach students. This shortage of teachers is due to the low return rate of ethnic minority students who originally decide to be cadre to serve their communities but choose to stay in cities after they receive higher education. Additionally, there is no incentive of high-paid teaching positions at the remote ethnic regions that would attract qualified teachers, especially where basic needs are barely met. Postiglione, Zhu, and Jiao (2004) stated that teachers

have a significant impact on identity formation in Tibetan students. The campus environment that teachers build and develop has integrated Tibetan culture with the Han majority culture in terms of ideological themes of national unity and harmony.

Lifestyle

The uniqueness of ethnic minorities is not only manifested in their languages, but also in their lifestyles. Micro-level identity construction proposed by Kayongo-Male and Lee (2004) argued that students' family backgrounds and significant life events could contribute to the formation of identity. Ethnic groups residing in the remote regions, such as the Xinjiang autonomy region, were investigated and it was proven that their nomadic lifestyle would hinder ethnic minority students from attending schools and succeeding in learning universal knowledge and skills. It is also evident that children from homes that practice religion hardly practice this religion in school (Chiang, 2001). A large number of ethnic minorities receive rural education in places where agricultural and nomadic lifestyles are dominant. The effects of this upbringing may transfer to the educational achievement.

Local Need for Education

The underlying motivation for educating ethnic minorities is to provide more skilled workers for ethnic local communities to develop the economy and improve the standard of living. Although some students attend higher institutes of learning, they are still expected to return to their hometown and serve the local communities. As mentioned in the category of teacher-student relations, most ethnic minorities who attend higher education would prefer not to return to the regions from which they came. With such a low return rate, communities do not actually benefit from sending the most promising

minority students to receive higher education. Thus, local needs continue to be left unmet. However, education is important, and its long term effects on spurring social development and economic growth is crucial. By providing ethnic minority students with opportunities to gain knowledge and skills, ethnic communities would leave economic backwardness behind and attract the well-educated ethnic minorities to serve the needs of the communities. More importantly, these ethnic minority students would construct their identities in the communities, especially in highly populated ethnic regions such as the Tibetan autonomous region. Future research needs to look at the different return rates of ethnic minority students across different ethnic groups and regions to determine if identity creates a strong emotional affiliation among students and encourages them to return to their native regions.

National Policy on Preferential Admission

In order to provide better education for the ethnic minorities, the Chinese central government has implemented educational policies geared toward the ethnic minority groups. Although by having preferential admission ethnic minority students who want to attend higher institutes have a higher chance of doing so, they are still confronted with competition from the Han majority who are much more prepared by the higher quality of their pre-college education after ethnic minority students are admitted to the higher institutes. Language in this sense is additionally the obstacle to gaining higher quality education. It is for these reasons that identity conflicts often occur in minority college students. Scholars from China expressed their concern about ethnic moral education in colleges and saw the difficulties that arise when minority students are educated with the Han ideologies. Previous research also recognized that there is a feeling of inferiority in

these ethnic minority students when they distinguish themselves from others in the comparison that they make of themselves to others. Both researchers and policy makers are now realizing that college-level identity construction can actually cause antagonistic behaviors and can even lead to violence in some cases. The need for more research on the subject has never been greater.

Recommendations for Meta-Analysis

Large amounts of achievement-based studies agree that increasing monetary inputs does not necessarily improve student achievement and that non-monetary inputs actually have a more significant impact on achievement of ethnic minorities. Studies of achievement among ethnic minority students in China have demonstrated that non-monetary inputs, especially in terms of ethnic identities, do affect achievement. The approaches designed to improve student achievement in other countries also proved effective in China. Measures such as class size reduction, increases in teacher salaries, and provisions for facilities all lead to greater achievement. However, China has not fully developed economically and the focus of most of its national development in the past two decades has been on economic growth. Although the government expenditure on education has gone up, it is still small in comparison to the percentage of GDP growth (According to UNESCO's Institute of Statistics, China's 2004 public expenditure on education as a percentage of GDP is 2.1 %). The expenditure on schools located in the ethnic minority regions is far below what is considered sufficient. These schools lack experienced teachers and basic facilities. Increasing monetary inputs is sorely needed. The shortcomings of schools in these areas have been recognized by the scholars and are seen as underlying factors in poor achievement among ethnic minority students. Scholars

have called for more government supported educational investment. Recent studies have looked more closely at non-monetary inputs and their effect on achievement, but the issue of identity construction has not been thoroughly examined. Discussed below are the main directions that the majority of scholars have taken in their research thus far.

First, a great amount of existing literature on ethnic minorities and their achievement focuses on bilingual education and curriculum development. This issue has been investigated substantially because language barriers are viewed as the key restraint that holds ethnic minority students back from succeeding academically. Implementing bilingual education could open a path for ethnic students to access the knowledge taught to them in Mandarin. This is a step that will show prompt and strong results. In contrast, students' identities are constructed in a variety of contexts and change over the course of time. A method of measuring and classifying identity has not been clearly stated or used in ethnic achievement studies in China. Although Kayongo-Male (2004) provided a model from the studies of college minority students, the application of this model to primary and secondary levels has not been proven. Moreover, the 55 ethnic groups that exist in China differ greatly in terms of cultural practices, religious beliefs, and other factors, which makes them hard to study as a single group. The study of bilingual education builds foundations to initiate other studies on topics such as the roots of sociolinguistics and variations that affect identity in achievement.

Second, current research covers a variety of issues such as language barriers, socioeconomic background, and previous schooling; however, it is rare to see research whose only focus is ethnic identity and achievement. The models proposed that are based on the data collected from a certain area may not be applicable in other areas. Many

factors that are considered influential on student achievement (such as lifestyle) are not analyzed in terms of identity construction. More empirical studies should be launched to review these issues specifically and compare them in terms of their involvement in identity construction. It is also important to study each factor discussed in results and explore the sub-factors that lead to the formation of these factors.

As far as Chinese research is concerned, Chinese publications are complimentary to English publications. Interestingly, most research done by Chinese scholars examined the factors of poor achievement from a macro level, such as the governmental policies and resource allocation. The majority of this work has recommended improvements to the quality of education for the ethnic minority students in the form of adjusted policy implementation. Some studies stated that education for ethnic minorities will bring them into the modern world with knowledge and skills and thus make them more valuable to the society as a whole (Guo, 1997; Teng & Su, 1998). Most importantly, these articles saw the importance of promoting a moral education for ethnic minorities and stressed its integrative role in national stability and development. Additionally, some discussions mentioned the differences between ethnic cultures and the mainstream culture, but seldom acknowledged that this could lead to differences in achievement. Very few empirical works have been found in Chinese on issues of achievement. The attention of Chinese scholars should be switched to a micro-level analysis of the education system. At the macro level, scholars should look at how policies have impacted ethnic minority students in terms of identity construction so that future policy formation can be focused toward the best interests and needs of minorities.

More and more empirical studies are investigating education for ethnic minorities at the higher level and the issues these minorities face in these environments. The issue of ethnic identity and achievement has also been examined. Some scholars chose to study students from China's *Minzu Xueyuan* (higher institutes of learning for ethnic minorities that specialize in studies related to ethnic minorities and usually admit ethnic minority students as their main student body). These minority students are well educated and speak Mandarin, which eliminates the language barriers that has plagued so many minorities. There have been many theories about higher education for ethnic minorities that have been studied and tested in a variety of school environments. Compared with education at the primary and secondary level, the ethnic minority student body in higher education is more homogenous. The students who have been admitted to higher institutes usually speak Mandarin Chinese and their achievement levels meet the requirements of National College Entrance Exam. The homogeneity of this educational system also facilitates data collection at this level, especially with such strong theoretical framework. However, as far as ethnic identity and achievement is concerned, more studies need to be geared toward the primary and secondary levels of education, where the process of identity construction is very active and dynamic. The contributing factors of ethnic identity are likely noticeable and identifiable in this setting. Although examining the schooling experiences of ethnic minority college students would reflect the identity construction these students have encountered from interactive activities in schools, these identities cannot fully display a picture of the variations of identity and how they change over time in regard to achievement.

The third trend in almost all the studies was the focus on a single ethnic minority group. Although some work attempted to compare achievements between the Han majority and one particular ethnic group, few comparative studies have been done between different ethnic groups in China. In the earlier studies of education for ethnic minorities, scholars usually provided an overview of certain ethnic minorities and covered one portion of education in their research. This may have been because few people have extensive knowledge of China's ethnic groups. In the later work, after more research had been carried out, some issues arose, such as the central government's policy implementation, poor educational achievement, and bilingual education. Attention then shifted to one or more areas of study. In the area of achievement studies, the Han majority is always seen as a counterpart of the minority students and there is always a considerable achievement gap between them. However students from certain ethnic groups, such as Korean or Hui Muslims did achieve higher than their Han counterparts, especially those who live in urban areas and receive a similar quality of education as the Han. More studies need to look at factors that might lead to higher achievement of certain ethnic minority students.

The identity issues arising from the Chinese ethnic minority education are evident in other countries as well, but few comparative studies have been conducted cross-nationally. Much research has been done on ethnic Chinese living overseas and the identity issues that they experience. Although indirectly related to the point of this thesis, these studies have not been included. There has also been work done concerning ethnic minority residents in other countries and their achievement in school, but its relevance to the Chinese ethnic minorities is rarely discussed. Comparisons have been drawn with

affirmative action in the United States and preferential policy implementation in China for ethnic minorities.

Recommendations for Future Research

Since this is a meta analysis, it cannot improve on the quality and reporting of the original studies. The quality of data collected in original studies is not considered. It is also affected by the publication bias and selection bias of the author. Due to the nature of this thesis and time constraints, an empirical study was not conducted in China, however this thesis could contribute to the knowledge of ethnic minority education and benefit future work in the field. Some recommendations for future research can be made based upon the findings of this thesis.

A comprehensive approach to studying ethnic identity and school achievement should be taken both in theoretical and empirical orientations. Before any further steps are taken, ethnic minority students must be viewed with cultural sensitivity. A basic understanding of ethnicity, stereotyped ethnic backwardness in economy, and other social involvement (such as education) must already be in place. All levels of education for ethnic minority students needed to be studied as an integrated whole in order to examine the perpetual process of identity construction and its contribution to achievement.

Since this field is improving, the opportunity to better develop this field is there and should be taken advantage. The focus of current research needs to shift from the macro level to the micro level, examining the beliefs and values of ethnic minority students and the ways they construct their identities. Based on various findings, a large percentage of previous research on education for ethnic minorities is still at the stage of introducing a curriculum for certain ethnic groups that includes a brief overview of ethnic

background and social environment. Some researchers focus on policy reviewing and critiques, raising theory-oriented education issues regarding ethnic minorities. Although some empirical work has been initiated in Xinjing, Gansu, and Yunnan in the past five years, only a small group of ethnic minority students have been studied. Large populations of ethnic minorities are not represented in these studies. Ethnicity has always been a culturally-sensitive topic, and it is hard for outsiders to understand the lives of those from another group. Working with local research institutes or experienced teachers and scholars from Chinese universities would be a better way to approach ethnic regions and people there.

The research on ethnic identity has begun, and researchers and scholars have come to realize the relationship between ethnic identity and achievement. Ethnic identity changes continuously as individuals interact with people of the same or different ethnic groups. Since identity construction is dependent on each individual, a general conclusion is not applicable to all ethnic groups. Further research should examine specifically what level of identity construction is most influential on academic achievement within a certain group, and at which stage it is easiest to impose solutions for improving achievement at primary, secondary, and tertiary levels of education.

All of the factors discussed have an impact on identity construction to a certain degree. Each of these categories has been identified by the scholars or policy makers. However, these categories are not discussed in terms of the effects of differences in identity. More research can also investigate the forms of identity construction, such as language and religion, which are most significant in student achievement. These forms can also be studied in terms of relevance to identity construction. They may be identified

as symbolic manifestations when ethnic minority students regard themselves apart from each other.

Identity issues are not the only causes of poor achievement. Certain identities may only be related to distinguishing ethnic background of certain groups without a connection with school achievement. More comparative studies are needed to explore the various aspects of ethnic identity within different dominant cultural contexts, and to locate certain identities that contribute to achievement for individuals from different cultural backgrounds. In China, only one dominant culture, the Han, exists. This dominant culture has been imposed on other ethnic cultures as a common ideology that contributes to cultural homogeneity and stability. However, the rise of other cultures in China as a result of globalization has transformed China into a heterogonous state. A new identity has formed between the Han and other cultures while native ethnic identities are interrupted. The dominant Han culture is challenged, and more aspects of identity are uncovered. Researchers need to consider the ongoing process of identity shifting and transforming as they launch new studies.

Conclusion

The research in the field of educational achievement of ethnic minorities and its relationship with identity construction has been initiated in terms of both theoretical model seeking and quantitative work of education in general. Many studies have proven that increasing educational expenditure for ethnic minority students would tremendously improve the quality of education and lead to higher educational achievement. However, ethnic identities have been found to be significant in impacting achievement in education. The issues of achievement have been raised by researchers and policy makers, but the

large gap between educational provisions for individuals of different ethnic groups has overridden the underlying factor of identity construction. Some recommendations have been made to remedy the situation. The study of bilingual education builds foundations to initiate other studies on topics such as the roots of sociolinguistics and variations that affect identity in achievement. Studies also need to switch from macro level to micro level concentration, and more attention should be given to primary and secondary education. It is also important to determine the levels of identity construction and their different impacts on the achievement. Knowing the cultural context is the key to understanding identity construction and its association with education. Therefore, more research needs to be undertaken to examine the non-monetary inputs and their impact on achievement since monetary inputs are limited in China.

REFERENCES

Ballou, D., & Podgursky, M. (1995). Recruiting smarter teachers. *Journal of Human Resources, 30*(2), 326-338.

Bernstein, B. (2000). *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control, and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique* (2nd ed.). Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.

Betts, J. R. (1996). Is there a link between school inputs and earnings? Fresh scrutiny of an old literature. In G. Burtless (Ed.), *Does Money Matter? The Effect of School Resources on Student Achievement and Adult Success* (pp. 141-191). Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution.

Black, S. E. (1999). Do better schools matter? Parental valuation of elementary education. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 577-599.

Blum, S. (2000). Tales from the fields of Yunnan: Listening to Han stories. *Modern China, 26*(2), 148-165.

Borland, M. V., Howsen, R. M., & Trawick, M. W. (2005). An investigation of the effect of class size on student academic achievement. *Education Economics, 13*(1), 73-83.

Brewer, D. J., Kroop, C., Gill, B. P., & Reichardt, R. (1999). Estimating the cost of national class size reductions under different policy alternatives. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis, 21*(2), 179-192.

Cai, B. (1994). Lun shao shu min zu jiao yu de te zheng. *Xi Bei Shi Da Xue Bao, 31*(4), 58-63.

Carbonaro, W. (2005). Tracking students' effort and academic achievement. *Sociology of Education, 78*(1), 27.

Cast, A. D. (2003). Identities and behavior. In P. J. Burke, T. J. Owens, R. T. Serpe & P. A. Thoits (Eds.), *Advances in Identity Theory and Research* (pp. 41-53). New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers.

Chapman, W., Chen, X., & Postiglione, G. (2000). Is preservice teacher training worth the money? A study of teachers in ethnic minority regions of the People's Republic of China. *Comparative Education Review, 44*(3), 300-328.

Chen, C., & Uttal, D. H. (1988). Cultural values, parents' beliefs, and children's achievement in the U.S. and China. *Human Development, 31*, 351-358.

Chen, X., Rubin, K. H., & Li, D. (1997). Student achievements/China; Student achievements/Research; Cross-cultural studies. *Developmental Psychology, 33*, 518-525.

Chiang, L. (2001). *Education of Chinese Muslims: Changes in the 20th Century.* Paper presented at the American Association for Chinese Studies.

China Education and Research Network. Retrieved August 5, 2006, from http://www.edu.cn/ge_di_446/20060323/t20060323_56602.shtml.

Clothey, R. (2001). *China's Minorities and State Preferential Policies: Expanding Opportunities?* Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Comparative and International Education Society (45th, Washington, DC, March 14-17, 2001).

Dilger, B. (1984). The Education of Minority?. *Comparative Education, 20*(1), 155-164.

Din, F. S. (1998, October). *The Functions of Class Size Perceived by Chinese Rural School Teachers.* Paper presented at the Research Forum of the National Rural Education Association, Buffalo, NY.

Fischler, M. L. (2003). From crisis to growth: Race, culture, ethnicity, conflict and change. *Education, 124*(2), 396-400.

Geographic and Ethnic Diversity in China Site. Retrieved July 25, 2006, from http://www.einaudi.cornell.edu/curriculum/monkey/geographic/index.asp?grade= 3#2.

Gladney, D. (1999). Making Muslims in China: Education, Islamicization and representation. In G. Postiglione (Ed.), *National Minority Education* (pp. 55-94). New York and London: Falmer Press.

Guest, R. (2005). Will flexible learning raise student achievement? *Education Economics, 13*(3), 287-297.

Guo, F. (1997). Min Zu Xian Dai Hua Yu Min Zu Jiao Yu Xian Dai Hua. *Zhong Nan Min Zu Xue Yuan Xue Bao (Zhe Xue She Hui Ke Xue Ban), 85*, 108-110.

Hannum, E. (1999). Political change and the urban rural gap in basic education in China, 1949-1990. *Comparative Education Review, 43*(2), 193-211.

Hannum, E. (2002). Educational stratification by ethnicity in China: Enrollment and attainment in the early reform years. *Demography, 39*(1), 95-117.

Hansen, M. H. (1999). *Lessons in Being Chinese: Minority Education and Ethnic Identity in Southwest China*. Seattle: University of Washington Press.

Hanushek, E. A. (1981). Throwing money at schools. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management, 1*(1), 19-41.

Hanushek, E. A. (1997). Assessing the effects of school resources on student performance: An update. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis, 19*(2), 141-164.

Hoffman, D. M. (1998). A Therapeutic Moment? Identity, self, and culture in the Anthropology of education. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly, 29*(3), 324-346.

Hou, H. (2000). Looking at the quality of ethnic minority education in Xinjing province from the perspective of the University Entrance Examination. *Chinese Education and Society, 33*(1), 87-91.

Hu, S., & John, E. P. S. (2001). Student persistence in a public higher education system: Understanding racial and ethnic differences. *The Journal of Higher Education, 72*(3), 265-286.

Hunt, M. O. (2003). Identities and inequalities. In P. J. Burke, T. J. Owens, R. T. Serpe & P. A. Thoits (Eds.), *Advances in Identity Theory and Research* (pp. 71-84). New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers.

Jacob, N., & Harvey, D. (2005). Do parents make a difference to children's academic achievement? Differences between parents of higher and lower achieving students. *Educational Studies, 31*(4), 431-448.

Johnson, M. K., Crosnoe, R., & Elder, G. H. (2001). Students' attachment and academic engagement: The role of race and ethnicity. *Sociology of Education, 74*(4), 318-340.

Karmel, S. M. (1995-1996). Ethnic tension and the struggle for order: China's policies in Tibet. *Pacific Affairs, 68*(4), 485-580.

Kayongo-Male, D., & Lee, M. B. (2004). Macro and micro factors in ethnic identity construction and educational outcomes: Minority university students in the People's Republic of China. *Race Ethnicity and Education, 7*(3), 277-305.

Kiecolt, K. J., & LoMascolo, A. F. (2003). Roots of identity. In P. J. Burke, T. J. Owens, R. T. Serpe & P. A. Thoits (Eds.), *Advances in Identity Theory and Research* (pp. 27-40). New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers.

Krueger, A. B. (1999). Experimental estimates of education production function. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics, 114*(2), 497-532.

Lamontagne, J. (1999). National minority education in China: A nationwide survey across countries. In G. Postiglione (Ed.), *National Minority Education* (pp. 133-172). New York and London: Falmer Press.

Lasley, T. J., Siedentop, D., & Yinger, R. (2006). A systemic approach to enhancing teacher quality: The Ohio model. *Journal of Teacher Education, 57*(1), 13-21.

Lawler, E. J. (2003). Interaction, emotion, and collective identities. In P. J. Burke, T. J. Owens, R. T. Serpe & P. A. Thoits (Eds.), *Advances in Identity Theory and Research* (pp. 135-149). New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers.

Lee, M. B. (2001). *Ethnicity, Education and Empowerment: How Minority Students in Southwest China Construct Identity*. England: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

Lee, M. B. (2003). *How Successful Ethnic Minority Students Construct Identities: Observations from Yunnan Province, PRC*. Paper presented at the Comparative and International Education Society, New Orleans.

Levin, H. M., & Kelley, C. (1994). Can education do it alone? *Economics of Education Review, 13*(2), 97-108.

Levin, H. M., & McEwan, P. J. (2002). Cost-effectiveness and educational policy. In H. M. Levin & P. J. McEwan (Eds.), *Cost-effectiveness Analysis in Education:*

Progress and Prospects, 2002 Yearbook of the American Education Finance Association (pp. 1-17). Larchmont, NY: Eye on Education.

Lofstedt, J. (1987). Education for national minorities in China: An overview. *The Journal of Negro Education, 56*(3), 326-337.

Lu, S., & Kong, M. (2001). A cross-cultural study of intellectual and nonintellectual factors influencing mathematical ability in Tibetan and Han students. *Chinese Education and Society, 34*(5), 59-70.

Mackerras, C. (1999). Religion and the education of china's minorities. In G. Postiglione (Ed.), *National Minority Education* (pp. 23-54). New York and London: Falmer Press.

Marx, J. H. (1980). The ideological construction of post modern identity models in contemporary cultural movement. In R. Robertson & B. Holzner (Eds.), *Identity and Authority: Explorations in the Theory of Society* (Vol. 145-189). England: Basil Blackwell.

Mateakeju, P., & Strakova, J. (2005). The role of the family and the school in the reproduction of educational inequalities in the post Communist Czech Republic. *British Journal of Sociology of Education, 26*(1), 17-40.

Maynard, Herman; Mehrtens, Susan. (1993). *The Fourth Wave: Business in the 21st Century.* San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler.

McBride, B. A., & Schoppe-Sullivan, S. J. (2005). The mediating role of fathers' school involvement on student achievement. *Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology: An International Lifespan Journal, 26*(2), 201-216.

Okagaki, L., & Frensch, P. A. (1998). Parenting and children' school achievement: A multiethnic perspective. *American Educational Research Journal, 35*(1), 123-144.

Oyserman, D., Gant, L., & Ager, J. (1995). A socially contextualized model of African American identity: Possible selves and school persistence. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 69*, 1216-1232.

Picus, L. O., Marion, S. F., Calvo, N., & Glenn, W. J. (2005). Understanding the relationship between student achievement and the quality of educational facilities: Evidence from Wyoming. *Peabody Journal of Education, 80*(3), 71-95.

Postiglione, G. (1998). *State Schooling and Ethnicity in China: The Rise or Demise of Multiculturalism?* Paper presented at the the World Congress of Sociology.

Postiglione, G., Zhu, Z., & Jiao, B. (2004). From ethnic segregation to impact integration: state schooling and identity construction for rural Tibetans. *Asian Ethnicity, 5* (Number 2/ June 2004), 195-217.

Pritchard, R. J., Morrow, D., & Marshall, J. C. (2005). School and district culture as reflected in student voices and student achievement. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement, 16*(2), 153-177.

Saifer, S., Edwards, K., Ellis, D., Ko, L., & Amy, S. (2005). Classroom to community and back: Using culturally responsive, standards-based teaching to strengthen family and community partnerships and increase student achievement. *Northwest Regional Educational Laboratory*.

Shimahara, N. K., Holowinsky, I. Z., & Tomlinson-Clarke, S. (2001). *Ethnicity, Race, and Nationaity in Education: A Global Perspective*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Stets, J. E. (2003). Justice, emotion, and identity theory. In P. J. Burke, T. J. Owens, R. T. Serpe & P. A. Thoits (Eds.), *Advances in Identity Theory and Research* (pp. 105-122). New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers.

Taylor, C. (2001). The relationship between student performance and school expenditures: A review of the literature and new evidence using better data. In D. H. Monk & H. J. Walberg (Eds.), *Improving Educational Productivity* (pp. 167-183) Information Age Publishing.

Teng, X. (1996). Zhong Hua Min Zu Duo Yuan YI Ti Ge Ju Si Xiang Yu Zhong Guo Shao Shu Min Zu Shuang Yu Jiao Yu. *Min Zu Jiao Yu Yan Jiu, 4*.

Teng, X., & Su, H. (1998). Zhong Guo Shao Shu Min Zu Di Qu Xian Dai Hua Guo Cheng Yu Jiao Yu Ji Hui Jun Deng. *Jiao Yu Ke Xue, 1*.

Torres, V., Howard-Hamilton, M. F., & Cooper, D. L. (2003). *Identity Development of Diverse Populations: Implications for Teaching and Administration in Higher Education, 29*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley Periodicals, Inc.

Trueba, H. T. (1994). Reflections on alternative visions of schooling. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly, 25*(376-393).

Trueba, H. T., & Zou, Y. (1994). *Power in Education: The Case of Miao University Students and its Significance for American Culture*. Washington D.C.: Falmer Press.

UNESCO Institute of Statistics. Retrieved December 19, 2006, from http://www.uis.unesco.org/profiles/EN/EDU/countryProfile_en.aspx?code=1560.

Wang, C., & Zhou, Q. (2003). Minority education in China: from state's preferential policies to dislocated Tibetan schools. *Educational Studies, 29*(1), 85-104.

Wang, Q., & Li, J. (2003). Chinese children's self-concepts in the domains of learning and social relations. *Psychology in the Schools, 40*(1), 85-101.

Wang, X. (1996a). Lun Shao Shu Min Zu Jiao Yu Wen Hua Bei Jing Min Zu Cha Yi Xing. *Min Zu Jiao Yu Yan Jiu, 3*.

Wang, X. (1996b). Shao Shu Min Zu Jiao Yu Fa Zhan de Min Zu Xue Si Kao. *Shan Xi Shi Fan Da Xue Xue Bao, 25*(3), 158-162.

Wu, D. (2004). *Choosing Identities: The Construction of Ethnic Identities Among the Ersu of Sichuan (Chinese text).* The Chinese University of Hong Kong: Hong Kong.

Xie, L. (1996). Lun Min Zu Xin Li Te Dian yu Min zu Yuan Xiao Si Xiang Jiao Yu. *Xi Nan Min Zu Xue Yuan Xue Bao, 4*, 92-94.

Yin, W. (1998). Dongxiang Autonomous County (Gansu Province). *Chinese Education and Society, 31*(3), 53-76.

Yinger, J. M. (1985). Ethnicity. *Annual Review of Sociology, 11*, 151-180.

Yuan, T. (2002). *Schooling in the Yao Mountains: An Ethnographic Study of the Tu Yao in Guangxi, China (Chinese text).* The Chinese University of Hong Kong: Hong Kong.

Zhang, L. (2006). Does student-teacher thinking style match/mismatch matter in students' achievement? *Educational Psychology, 26*(3), 395-409.

Zhu, Y., & Stuart, K. (1999). Education among the Minhe Monguo. In G. Postiglione (Ed.), *National Minority Education* (pp. 341-384). New York and London: Falmer Press.

Maynard, Herman; Mehrtens, Susan. (1993). *The Fourth Wave: Business in the 21st Century.* San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler.

APPENDIX A

Table 1
Comparison of Factors That Determine Identity Construction In China and The World

China	Numbers	World
Education environment (political and social)	15	Community force
Quality of teachers and methods of teaching	3	Attitudes and behaviors toward society
Purpose of education for ethnic minorities	6	Children's belief in school
Education Expenditure	11	Parenting (facilitating schooling)
Bilingual education	5	Family background
Interethnic perception	8	Teacher characteristics
Parents' social position	2	Teaching style
Social status	2	Tracking System
Community economy and culture	3	N/A
Family religion	7	N/A

APPENDIX B

Table 2
Arguments on Ethnic Identity and Student Achievement

T/E/P	EN/C	Author	Arguments
P	EN	Blachford & Zhu, 2003	The analysis is centered on two areas: (1) Formation and characteristics of China's ethnic minorities and their role in this multinational state, and the government institutional building and ethnic minority policies that contribute to national cohesion and unity. (2) National policy toward ethnic minority.
T/E	EN	Blum, 2000	This article discusses how the majority, Han, perceive minorities and minorities perceive themselves in China's Yunnan province. Using ethno-ethnicity method, the author divides ethnicity into six varieties (full, commoditized, manipulated, sentimental, unknowable, and class) in Han and minority interaction.
E	EN	Chapman, Chen & Postiglione, 2000	This study examines pre-service teacher training and different allocation of time in the classroom.
E	EN	Chen, Rubin & Dan, 1997	This research asserts that academic achievement can be used to predict children's social competence and peer acceptance. In turn, children's social functioning and adjustment, including social competence, aggression disruption, leadership, and peer acceptance; uniquely contributed to academic achievement.
E	EN	Chiang, 2001	Research shows that Muslim religious study will be taught in families and mosques, but it will have a hard time attracting young members of the generation to practice in real life.
P	EN	Clothey, 2001	Clothey explores the Chinese government's preferential policies toward minorities. It examines the ways in which the CCP has implemented these policies in its efforts toward modernization.
P	EN	Dilger, 1984	Dilger looks at enrollment of minority students in China, family planning, military strategy, and foreign policy of minority geographic location. There is a great increase in illiteracy, while no quality increase was reported.
E	EN	Feng, 1998	Feng finds that all the rural teachers preferred smaller classes, but did not regard them as necessarily related to student achievement. The teachers considered outside influences of society and home, as well as the learning atmosphere of school and class, to be important factors in learning outcomes. Teachers encourage competition among students, which they believe facilitates achievement.

Table 2 (continued)
Arguments on Ethnic Identity and Student Achievement

T/E/P	EN/C	Author	Arguments
E	EN	Feng, 1999	This study explores Chinese urban teachers' preference for teaching small classes, perceiving small class size as a beneficial factor not directly related to student achievement. They believed that small classes facilitated more individualized help from teachers, more student-teacher interactions, better classroom management, and a reduced teacher workload. They also believed in teachers encouraging and creating competition among students, which they regarded as important for students in large classes to succeed. Some cultural differences were also found.
T	EN	Fischler, 2003	Fischler outlines six steps from crisis to growth in the context of race, culture, and ethnicity in the process of identity construction.
P	EN	Gladney, 1999	Gladney examines the notion of class, secularism, economic backwardness, and dual educational system (secular and religious).
E	EN	Goldstein Kyaga, 1993	Goldstein probes the way educational achievements have been compared among Tibetans in Tibet, India, and Switzerland. Achievement is related to the degree achievement controls the institutions of education and political power.
E	EN	Hannum, 1999	Hannum discusses the shift in the political context of education policy and the implications of these shifts for urban and rural areas. Promotion of economic goals for education associated with market reforms in China came at the cost of equitable distribution of opportunities across the urban rural boundary.
E	EN	Hannum, 2002	Hannum asserts that the ethnic gap can be attributed, in part, to compositional differences in geographic location of residence and socioeconomic background. There is no general tendency toward a greater gender gap in achievement for minorities than for the ethnic Chinese, but significant differences in the gender gap emerge across individual ethnic groups.
P	EN	Postiglione, 1998	Postiglione asserts that minority religions, which traditionally provided much of the education outside of the family, are tolerated increasingly officially, but not really recognized in state schooling. Language is another major challenge related to ethnic minorities' culture and schooling. There is a strong national call to use Mandarin Chinese as the main medium in instruction, but in many cases efforts are being made to educate in minority languages. Although the provision of education for ethnic minorities has been increasing, most minorities are below the national average at all education levels.

Table 2 (continued)

Arguments on Ethnic Identity and Student Achievement

T/E/P	EN/C	Author	Arguments
P	EN	Hansen, 1999	Hansen claims that education of minorities plays a central role in implicitly reproducing notions of cultural inequality while explicitly promoting the unity of the nation. The inequality between majority and minority is affected by state policy and responses to the global modernization. Social mobility is also regarded as motivation for ethnic minorities to receive education provided by the state.
E	EN	Hansen, 2004	Hansen finds that for many women belonging to ethnic minorities in China, participation in school education offers the opportunity to find jobs outside their villages and thereby enhance their status in Chinese society, while at the same time it instills in them feelings of cultural inadequacy. Ethnic minority have developed feelings of inferiority based on their ethnic affiliation.
E	EN	Harrell & Ma, 1999	This study asserts that ideology or perception of success is insufficient to explain the differences in educational attainment that are transparently due to practical difficulties in attending school. Social status is still extremely important. It proves instrumental in preserving cultural traditions and ethnic identity.
P	EN	Hawkins, 1978	Hawkins looks at educational policy toward ethnic minorities. The educational enterprise itself has been revealed as equally complex, leading to suggestions that an organization increasingly viewed as serving a maintenance function also has the capacity to interface with other societal and cultural components in a dynamic and dialectical manner.
T	EN	Hon, 1996	Hon takes a horizontal approach to study variation of minority, their policy modification to Pan-Hanism, and the interactions between multiple ethnic groups. Uneducated masses and the minority ethnic groups would be the vital forces to rejuvenating the country. Bringing these people from the periphery to the center will give China a hope of social development.
E	EN	Hong & Lee, 1999	Hong and Lee find no significant differences in the perceptual sensitivity elements (auditory, visual , tactile, Kinesthetic) between high and low achieving students, while some group differences were found on the physical elements (intake, mobility) in some of the achievement and attitude measures. Teachers and parent roles are very important in student achievement.

Table 2 (continued)

Arguments on Ethnic Identity and Student Achievement

T/E/P	EN/C	Author	Arguments
P	EN	Hou, 2000	Hou finds the main problems are the inability of the quality of education to keep pace with the requirements of the times; the inconsistency between the deployment structure, levels structure, and specializations structure of education and the economic and social development of the Xinjiang Province; and the acute contradiction between increasing demands for education and insufficient investment. Improving the quality of ethnic minority education is very important, particularly the educational funds.
E	EN	Harrell & Ma, 1999	This study asserts that ideology or perception of success is insufficient to explain the differences in educational attainment that are transparently due to practical difficulties in attending school. Social status is still extremely important. It proves instrumental in preserving cultural traditions and ethnic identity.
P	EN	Jiang, 2002	Jiang believes that government policies place an emphasis on preserving ethnic cultures or advancement into mainstream society.
P	EN	Johnson, 2000	Johnson explores how to achieve universal education for all students and at the same time contain regional ethnic resistance against the communist government and maintain national unity. Multilingual education is a solution provided for solving conflicts between Tibetan and China state schoolings.
P	EN	Karmel, 1995	Karmel looks at the leadership's continued ethnocentric attitudes toward the value of Tibetan culture generally. The success of the policy in Tibet is by no means assured.
T	EN	Kayongo Male & Lee, 2004	The authors of this study conceptualize ethnic identity as a product of multiple levels of societal structures in a dialectical relationship with the individual student, who constructs reality and responds to the constructions of others. The macro- and micro-level factors at work are nation state designation of some groups as minority nationality or ethnic groups, students' family and community background, significant life events, campus status hierarchies, experiences of interaction on campus, and status negotiation by the student.
E	EN	Kwong, 1983	Kwong asserts that family units and differences in social stratifications influence educational achievements in ways of parental encouragement and coaching. Therefore, children from cadre and intellectual families do better than children from peasant and worker families. The author discovers that a system of grades actually gives children with intellectual family background more opportunities to receive education and this gap is widening between the two types of families.

Table 2 (continued)
Arguments on Ethnic Identity and Student Achievement

T/E/P	EN/C	Author	Arguments
P	EN	Kwong & Xiao, 1989	Kwong and Xiao look at political domination along with China's cultural and economic superiority within China and in the neighboring countries. The achievement of educational equality is not a function of the availability of the schools alone but also rests on the culture and economy of the communities in which these opportunities are located.
T	EN	Lamontagne, 1999	Lamontagne explored the interrelationship of educational development between ethnicity and territory as influenced by economic structure, occupations, social stratification, residential patterns, traditions, language, and cultural change.
P	EN	Lattimore, 1973	Lattimore explores the general conditions in China's northern frontier lands since the Great Cultural Revolution.
T	EN	Lee, 2001	Lee asserts that successful students, to a certain extent, must leave behind objective ethnic markers, like language and religion, if they want to succeed in school. The school is the site where critical identity construction occurs. Administrators and teachers assign meanings to social actors. Administrators and teachers label minority children and have the power to make these labels stick.
E	EN	Lee, 2003	Lee's findings focused on ways families helped students succeed in school, students' perceptions of family help and their obligations to repay such help; ways students were defined by their family and village; importance of role models and significant others; ways teachers and peers helped students construct achievement-oriented selves; difficulties in recruiting, training, and retaining teachers; and financial support for minority education in China at the college level.
E	EN	Lewin, 1995	Lewin probes the ways development of education among the Yi may rely more on the preferences and interests of relatively local groups than on support and subsidy at the national level and on national policy at the primary level.
P	EN	Lofstedt, 1987	Lofstedt looks at the problems and constraints the Chinese minorities have such as adverse geographical conditions, language variations, and sundry manifestations of cultural-ethnic conflicts. In addition, economic and cultural levels are often very low in minority areas. It is argued that great strides have been made in terms of minority access to and participation in primary education, but less progress is evident with respect to secondary and tertiary education.
E	EN	Lu & Kong, 2001	Lu and Kong find that although cognitive factors have an important effect on the development of the mathematical ability of these students, the dominant position of intelligence is equally important. Although non-intelligence factors are not directly involved in discernible learning activities, they shape the individual's consciousness and influence a person's attitude toward learning.

Table 2 (continued)
Arguments on Ethnic Identity and Student Achievement

T/E/P	EN/C	Author	Arguments
P	EN	Mackerras, 1999	Mackerras finds that the influence of Islam is still strong enough in personal lives of its adherents to make a significant difference in their private behavior; authorities remain highly successful in keeping religion out of the secular education system among minority groups. The universal curriculum, political concerns, and educational expenditures are further discussed.
E	EN	Postiglione, Zhu & Jiao, 2004	Data are presented on policies, student recruitment, curriculum, teachers, and the campus environment, and their impact on students' identity formation. The school architecture, sculptures, photographs, wall paintings, and so forth provide representations of Tibetan culture, albeit selectively, and are interpreted by the state in terms of the ideological themes of national unity, patriotism, revolutionary traditions, and civilized behavior. The conclusion points to a "make or break" opportunity for state education to support a more even-handed cultural policy, rather than the dichotomy of segregation and impact integration.
P	EN	Sautman, 2002	This article introduces some policies the Chinese government modified to expand the access to higher education for China's national minorities. The preferential admissions is examined as the only policy provided to every minority ethnic regardless of their residential area whose average could surpass the Han majority in their level of tertiary schooling. The issue of tension that arose from preferential admissions and the inequality between different ethnic groups is also discussed. Sautman concludes that most beneficiaries of preferential admissions will become the professionally competent and politically loyal graduates that the policy is designed to produce.
T	EN	Trueba, 1994	Trueba uses the articles to reflect a penetrating reflection on the themes of ethnic identity, reflective teaching, the linkages between theory and praxis, basic research, and policies affecting the implementation of practice. He describes a case study of the Miao people in China, Trueba discusses the relationships between ethnic identity and cultural therapy, critical pedagogy, and empowerment.
E	EN	Wang & Zhou, 2003	This article discusses the rationales, policies, implementations, and results of the development of minority basic education. The examination of the 9-year compulsory schooling and the boarding school system for minority pupils suggests contradictions and mismatches between state policies and implementations. The article reveals educational, as well as geographical, displacement of minority schooling, particularly the internationally little-known Tibetan schools and classes that have been radically developed in the metropolises of Han majority. The dislocation of reform for minority basic education, especially the lack of cultural sensitivity, is further compounded by the ubiquitous practices of pupil tracking and school differentiation in the education system

Table 2 (continued)

Arguments on Ethnic Identity and Student Achievement

T/E/P	EN/C	Author	Arguments
E	C	Wang, 2002	Wang used questionnaires and interviews to study 800 minority college students. The study is an overview of current education for ethnic minorities.
E	EN	Wang & Brie, 1997	This study investigates the impact of sibling ranking and the number of siblings per family on student achievement in ninth grade science. Secondary analysis was conducted based on empirical data from a key project sponsored by the China State Commission of Education in the late 1980s. Findings indicate that the science achievement of students with one sibling or no siblings was significantly different from those with two or more siblings based on an international measure of science achievement.
E	EN	Wang & Li, 2003	This study analyzes Chinese children's self-concept in two distinct domains—the domain of learning and the domain of social relations. It demonstrates that Chinese children's self-concept has a strong autonomous component in the context of learning and achievement while displaying a social orientation in the context of relationships and family. It shows how these tendencies of Chinese self relate to Confucian ethics and how they are shaped by early socialization.
E	C	Wu, 2004	Wu's research shows that the Chinese government plays a crucial role in the politics of people's identities. Both local ethnic interaction and Chinese minzu (Nationality) policy have contributed to the intensification of ethnic consciousness among the Ersu people. Seeking the best economic and political advantages, as well as the better position in relations of power, Ersu people choose their ethnic identities rationally in a variety of ways.
E	EN	Xie, 1996	Xie found there to be no relationship between parenting style or parents' educational level and school achievement. Regression analyses indicated that the higher the parents' expectations of their children's middle school selection, the better the child's academic achievement. Parents of children with low achievement assigned extra homework more often than parents of children with high achievement.
P	EN	Yin, 1998	Yin discusses the general situations of China's Dongxiang minority in terms of geographic position, administrative system, religion, and economic development. The study also addresses the problem of education in the county, where rate of primary schooling is one of the lowest in China; the condition of the schools and of financing which grows more and more serious as teachers are not given their full salary on time; the persistently low quality of education; and the inadequate quality of teacher education. The author also considers political factors of educational development such as the preferential admission policy for minorities and school effects. Other socioeconomic, historical, geographical, and cultural factors issues are addressed in this article.

Table 2 (continued)
Arguments on Ethnic Identity and Student Achievement

T/E/P	EN/C	Author	Arguments
E	EN	Yuan, 2002	Yuan carried out an ethnographic study on the Tu yao ethnic minority. The study sees the backwardness of local conditions and finds that the local government's apathy toward minority education and the imbalance in the distribution of local power have adverse impacts on the achievement of minority schooling besides poverty.
P	EN	Zhu & Stuart, 1999	The authors of this study address issues including inadequate education infrastructure, minimal financial support from the local government, low-quality teaching, high levels of historical illiteracy and poverty, and the dominant Mandarin Chinese language that differs greatly from their own Altaic one. In conclusion, the author suggests that one possible option would be agreements between local regions stipulating local support in terms of labor and financial support in partnership with government assistance. The authors also feel that ethnic identity should be addressed in future educational development

Note. T = Theory, P= Policy, E = Empirical, EN = English, C = Chinese